

SCOUNDREL

***How a Convicted Murderer Persuaded the Women
Who Loved Him, the Conservative Establishment,
and the Courts to Set Him Free***

SARAH WEINMAN



An Imprint of HarperCollins Publishers

SCOUNDREL. Copyright © 2022 by Sarah Weinman. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews. For information, address HarperCollins Publishers, 195 Broadway, New York, NY 10007.

This is a work of nonfiction. Some names have been changed to protect the privacy of individuals.

HarperCollins books may be purchased for educational, business, or sales promotional use. For information, please email the Special Markets Department at SPsales@harpercollins.com.

Ecco® and HarperCollins® are trademarks of HarperCollins Publishers.

FIRST EDITION

Background art by Nik Merkulov/ Shutterstock, Inc.

Designed by Michelle Crowe

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Weinman, Sarah, author.

Title: Scoundrel : how a convicted murderer persuaded the women who loved him, the conservative establishment, and the courts to set him free / Sarah Weinman.

Description: First edition. | New York, NY : Ecco, an imprint of HarperCollins Publishers, [2022] | Includes bibliographical references and index. |

Identifiers: LCCN 2021044151 (print) | LCCN 2021044152 (ebook) | ISBN 9780062899767 (hardcover) | ISBN 9780062899798 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Smith, Edgar, 1934-2017. | Murderers--New Jersey--Biography. | Swindlers and swindling--New Jersey--Biography.

Classification: LCC HV6248.S578 W45 2022 (print) | LCC HV6248.S578 (ebook) | DDC 364.152/3092--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044151>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044152>

22 23 24 25 26 LSC 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Notes

THIS BOOK is based on primary sources wherever available, including court documents and transcripts, prison and parole records, legislative records, testimony, and letters. I am grateful for the assistance of the following institutions: the Sterling Library at Yale University, which houses the William F. Buckley, Jr., Papers; the Rare Book & Manuscript Library at Columbia University, which houses the Sophie Wilkins Papers; the New Jersey State Archives in Trenton, New Jersey; the National Archives offices in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, and New York City; and the Harry Ransom Center, University of Texas at Austin in Austin, Texas.

I also relied on local newspaper coverage of Victoria Zielinski's March 1957 murder; the May 1957 trial of Edgar Smith; the trial's aftermath, including the many stays of execution and denied appeals; coverage of his 1976 arrest and conviction; and that trial's aftermath. Key sources included the *Bergen Evening Record* (later the *Bergen Record*), the *Paterson Evening News* and *Morning Call*, the *Ridgewood Herald-News*, the *New York Daily News*, the *New York Times*, the *Scranton Times-Tribune*, the

Philadelphia *Bulletin*, and the *Los Angeles Times*. Access to these newspapers was primarily through Newspapers.com.

Biographical information about Victoria Zielinski and her family and Edgar Smith and his family was gleaned through census records (1920–1940), various indices for births, marriages, deaths, and obituaries, all obtained through Ancestry.com.

I conducted interviews for the book between 2015 and 2021. Rosemarie Ho conducted additional source interviews as part of the fact-checking process, and is cited accordingly. Sources included Myrna Zielinski, Barbara Nixon, Liza Rassner, Adam Wilkins, Daniel Wilkins, Isaac Wilkins, Caroline Hinkley, Stephen F. Lichtenstein, Jack Carley, Christopher Buckley, Michael Pancer, Geoffrey Norman, Paige Hiemier, Ronald Calissi, “Patti Hafford,” “Jennifer Hafford,” Ronald Sullivan, Kathy Hourigan, Robert Gottlieb, Nancy Nicholas, Toinette Lippe, Anne McCormick, David Quammen, Harry Camisa, and Tom Trantino.

Grateful acknowledgment for permission to access the William F. Buckley, Jr., Papers, as well as permission to reprint Buckley’s correspondence, is given to Christopher Buckley, on behalf of the William F. Buckley, Jr., estate. Grateful acknowledgment for permission to reprint Sophie Wilkins’s correspondence is given to Adam Wilkins, and to “Patti Hafford” to reprint Edgar Smith’s correspondence.

On occasion, typographical errors have been corrected for clarity and are the only instances of altering quoted material.

ABBREVIATIONS USED

AAKR: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc. Records, Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center, University of Texas at Austin

EHS: Edgar Herbert Smith, Jr.

NJSA: New Jersey State Archives

SCW: Sophie C. Wilkins

SFL: Stephen F. Lichtenstein

SMU: Steven M. Umin

SWP: Sophie Wilkins Papers, Series I, Correspondence Files, 1934–2003, Columbia University

WFB: William F. Buckley, Jr.

WFBP: William F. Buckley, Jr., Papers, Yale University

Please be advised that the page numbers listed below are associated with the hardcover edition of the book.

INTRODUCTION

- 1 **Edgar Smith died:** David Stout, “Edgar Smith, Killer Who Duped William F. Buckley, Dies at 83,” *New York Times*, September 25, 2017, B7; State of California, Board of Parole Hearings, High Desert State Prison, Susanville, California, April 23, 2009.
- 2 **Buckley at first took up:** Donald G. M. Coxe, email to the author, January 5, 2020.
- 2 **“Edgar Smith has done”:** William F. Buckley, Jr., “Edgar Smith, Act III,” *On the Right*, April 20, 1977.
- 8 **“would have made”:** Adam Wilkins, email to the author, December 23, 2018.

1. "WHERE IS VICKIE?"

- 11 **She was the Zielinskis' second child:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 5, 1957, 1; and *Paterson Evening News*, March 6, 1957, 36, among other sources; Victoria's birth record obtained through the Social Security Death Index and Find a Grave, <https://www.findagrave.com/memorial/7757106/victoria-zielinski>.
- 11 **The Zielinskis met:** 1930 and 1940 census records list the Zielinskis as living in Honesdale; further information about their changes of address can be found in *Scranton* [PA] *Times-Tribune*, March 5, 1957, 1, and *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 5, 1957, 1.
- 11 **Anthony's and Mary's ancestors:** Mary Zielinski obituary, *Scranton Times-Tribune*, January 5, 2002, 26; Anthony Zielinski obituary, *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, January 20, 1983, 46; 1920 census records for Anthony's father, Joseph Zielinski, and Mary's mother, Mary Mozeliak.
- 11 **Vickie complained about her father:** Author's interview with Barbara Nixon, April 2, 2019.
- 12 **"Just a kid":** Ibid.
- 12 **Which, at age fifteen:** *Ridgewood* [NJ] *Herald-News*, March 7, 1957, 2.
- 12 **Vickie was an honor roll student:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 5, 1957, 1; *Paterson News*, March 6, 1957, 1; *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), March 6, 1957, 4.
- 12 **The summer before her sophomore year:** *Scranton* [PA] *Times-Tribune*, March 6, 1957, 1.
- 12 **In tenth grade, Vickie's marks:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 5, 1957, 1.
- 12 **And Vickie did enjoy herself:** Author's interview with Barbara Nixon, April 2, 2019; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 5, 1957, 1; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 5, 1957, 1.
- 12 **One unnamed girlfriend complicated:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 2.
- 13 **One of the last photos:** Details gleaned from Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 73 (203a); photo reprinted by the Associated Press, March 6, 1957.
- 14 **At 7:30 that evening:** The sequence of events leading to Victoria Zie-

linski's murder is drawn from the trial transcript, reprinted in full in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, and corroborated by newspaper coverage at the time.

- 14 **Since the streets were poorly lit:** Testimony of Myrna Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 65–87 (195a–216a); and testimony of Barbara Nixon, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 87–95 (217a–224a).
- 14 **Vickie wore blue jeans:** Ibid.
- 15 **At about 8:30:** Testimony of Barbara Nixon, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 92 (222a).
- 15 **At midnight, when Vickie was:** Testimony of Mary Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 98 (228a).
- 16 **“Daddy, Vickie is missing”:** Testimony of Anthony Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 107 (237a).
- 16 **Anthony took Mary Faye’s car:** Testimony of Anthony Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 106 (236a).
- 16 **Later, Barbara would tell:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 6, 1957, 2.
- 16 **The next morning:** Testimony of Anthony Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 111–14 (241a–246a); testimony of Mary Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 100–4 (230a–234a).
- 17 **The police captain told Mary:** Testimony of Captain Edmund Wickham, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 119–21 (249a–251a).
- 17 **They found Vickie’s body:** Testimony of Anthony Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 105–18 (235a–248a); testimony of Captain Edmund Wickham, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 119–21 (249a–251a); *Daily News* (New York), March 6, 1957, 4.
- 17 **It was the damage to her head:** Testimony of Raphael Gilady, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 379–85 (509a–515a).

- 18 **Her father could hardly comprehend:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 1.
- 18 **Her dad had taught her judo:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 6, 1957, 2; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 6, 1957, 36; *Daily News* (New York), March 6, 1957, 3.
- 18 **“I’ll find the guy”:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 1.
- 18 **Less than twenty-four hours later:** *Ibid.*

2. THE MERCURY

- 19 **Joe Gilroy picked up the phone:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 229–56 (359a–386a).
- 19 **worked the third shift at Continental Can:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 18, 1957, 2.
- 19 **Eddie had quit or been fired:** *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), March 8, 1957, 1; testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 565–66 (687a–688a).
- 19 **Eddie was supposed to be:** His Mensa membership card, 1965, lists an IQ of 153, in the ninety-eighth percentile.
- 19 **He’d grown up all around:** 1940 census records for Joe Gilroy and Edgar Smith on Ancestry.com.
- 20 **his mother, Ann, had remarried:** Alexander Chupak obituary, *Orlando Sentinel*, August 3, 1994, 63; Social Security Death Index listing for Ann E. Chupak (1908–1993); Richard Smith (1927–1993), death announcement in the New Jersey Death Index, 1904–2000.
- 20 **Eddie had lived with:** Testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 512 (634a); Clinical record of Edgar H. Smith, Jr., CPL USMC, November 2, 1953, Tripler Army Hospital, APO 438; New Jersey Marriage Records, 1901–2017.
- 20 **Joe sometimes wondered:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 229–31 (359a–361a); clinical record of Edgar H. Smith, Jr., CPL USMC, Novem-

ber 2, 1953, Tripler Army Hospital, APO 438; *Bergen Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 1.

- 21 **Eddie arrived in the blue Mercury:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 233 (363a); testimony of Patricia Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 707 (829a).
- 22 **After he dropped off Eddie:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in *Counterpoint*, 248–50 (378a–380a).
- 22 **Joe Gilroy’s phone rang again:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 243–64; testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 543 (665a).
- 23 **When they pulled up to the house:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 243 (373a); testimony of Donald Hommell, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 310–11 (440a–441a).
- 24 **After that, the conversation veered:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 245–47 (375a–377a); testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in *Counterpoint*, 547 (669a).
- 24 **As he drove home:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, March 7, 1957, 1; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, March 6, 1957, 1.

3. “IF YOU’RE LOOKING FOR A FALL GUY . . .”

- 27 **Killings did happen:** See the front pages of *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), and *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, March 6, 1957; the *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), November 13, 1956, 1; and the front pages of the same papers on May 25, 1957.
- 27 **The police spent all of Tuesday afternoon:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 1.
- 27 **The tire tracks leading:** Testimony of Joseph Gilroy, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 231 (361a); *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, March 6, 1957, 1.

- 28 **Smith was questioned:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*; testimony of Carl De Marco and Vahe Garabedian, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 346–347 (476a–477a), 366 (496a).
- 28 **The interrogation continued:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 7, 1957, 19.
- 29 **A little later on:** Testimony of Carl De Marco, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 352 (482a); testimony of Edgar Smith, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 411 (541a); Edgar Smith, *Brief Against Death* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1968), 82.
- 29 **Officers Ulric Fairbanks:** Testimony of Ulric Fairbanks, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 371–78 (501a–508a); testimony of Addison Waldeck, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 487–92 (609a–614a); Smith, *Brief Against Death*, 92; testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 410 (540a).
- 29 **The police took Eddie:** Testimony of Raphael Gilady, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 380 (510a).
- 30 **The prosecutor’s office called in:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 7, 1957, 1; *Bergen Evening Record*, March 7, 1957, 9.
- 30 **At ten minutes before one:** Testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 456 (581a), 425 (552a–553a).
- 30 **It wasn’t a confession:** Testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 433 (560a–561a), 457 (581a–582a).
- 31 **When the group took him out to the crime scene:** Interrogation of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 456–57 (581a–582a).
- 31 **Eddie pointed to the spot:** Testimony of Gordon Graber, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 299 (429a).
- 31 **A little over an hour later:** Testimony of Charles deLisle, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 391 (521a); *Courier News* (Plainfield, NJ), March 7, 1957, 1.
- 32 **The announcement of the arrest:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 7, 1957, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 7, 1957, 1.

- 32 **Townpeople were quick to note:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 7, 1957, 9; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 8, 1957, 2; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 8, 1957, 10.
- 33 **Adding further intrigue:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 8, 1957, 2; clinical record of Edgar H. Smith, Jr., CPL USMC, November 2, 1953, Tripler Army Hospital, APO 438.
- 33 **One former employer:** *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), March 8, 1957, 1; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 7, 1957, 9; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 8, 1957, 2; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 8, 1957, 10.
- 33 **But another account:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 7, 1957, 1.
- 34 **Patricia Smith was thunderstruck:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 8, 1957, 1; *Daily News* (New York), March 8, 1957, 3.
- 35 **Only the month before:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 8, 1957, 2; *Daily News* (New York), March 8, 1957, 3.
- 35 **“After murder, what?”:** Reprinted in *Scranton* [PA] *Times-Tribune*, March 8, 1957, 3.
- 36 **She was buried:** *Scranton* [PA] *Times-Tribune*, March 8, 1957, 1.
- 37 **The service was conducted:** Ibid.
- 37 **Eddie’s mother, Ann Chupak:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 8, 1957, 1, and March 9, 1957, 1.
- 38 **Edgar Smith was indicted:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 9, 1957, 1; *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), March 16, 1957, 13; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 15, 1957, 1, 2.
- 38 **Both sides objected to the date:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 15, 1957, 2; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 15, 1957, 1.
- 38 **The time crunch became:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, March 22, 1957, 1; John E. Selser obituary, *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, September 19, 1979, D-25.
- 38 **He got a three-week extension:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, April 12, 1957, 1.
- 39 **Selser retained a private investigator:** Andy Nicol, investigative report, March 25–May 10, 1957, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 39 **Selser told Judge O’Dea:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 2, 1957, 2.

- 39 **As defense strategies go:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 14, 1957, 1 and 7.
- 39 **Guy Calissi was ready:** *Ibid.*

4. OPENINGS

- 41 **Ron Calissi took his seat:** This section is drawn from Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 43–45.
- 44 **Slowly and methodically:** Opening remarks of Guy W. Calissi, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 47–52 (177a–182a).
- 44 **John Selser was next:** Opening remarks of John E. Selser, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 52–62 (182a–192a).
- 46 **Guy Calissi interjected:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 62 (192a).
- 47 **Newspaper headlines that evening:** *Daily News* (New York), May 16, 1957, 1; *Asbury Park* [NJ] *Press*, May 16, 1957, 1; *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), May 16, 1957, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 16, 1957, 1.
- 47 **Myrna Zielinski was:** Testimony of Myrna Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 65–77 (195a–207a).
- 47 **Selser began his cross-examination:** Testimony of Myrna Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 77–86 (207a–216a).
- 47 **Next Calissi called Barbara Nixon:** Testimony of Barbara Nixon, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 87–95 (217a–225a); author’s interview with Barbara Nixon, April 2, 2019.
- 48 **Vickie’s mother, Mary:** Testimony of Mary Zielinski, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 95–105 (225a–235a).
- 48 **Over the next two days:** Testimony of the following law enforcement officials in *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, included Captain Edmund Wickham, 118–63 (248a–293a); James W. Stewart, 201–12 (331a–341a); Russell Ridgway, 212–28 (342a–358a) and 748 (870a); Gordon Graber, 287–307 (417a–437a); Arthur Abrams, 337–41 (467a–471a); Carl De Marco, 345–63 (475a–

494a); Vahe Garabedian, 364–71 (494a–501a); Ulric Fairbanks, 371–79 (501a–509a); Charles E. Smith, 387 (517a); Charles DeLisle, 388–91 (518a–521a); Henry Voss, 386–87 (517a–518a); Walter Spahr, 391–400 (521a–530a).

- 48 **When Calissi brought out:** Testimony of James W. Stewart, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in *Counterpoint*, 209–10 (339a–340a); *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 17, 1957, 2.
- 48 **Two female jurors gasped:** *Daily News* (New York), May 17, 1957, 3.
- 49 **But he had himself under control:** Ibid.; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 18, 1957, 1.
- 49 **At 3:30 that Friday afternoon:** Testimony of Donald Hommell, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 305 (435a); *Bergen Evening Record*, May 18, 1957, 1.
- 49 **Only that morning, he had told:** *Daily News* (New York), May 17, 1957, 3.
- 49 **As Hommell walked toward the stand:** Testimony of Donald Hommell, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 305–6 (435a–436a).

5. “I JUST THREW IT OUT THE WINDOW”

- 51 **It rained hard:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 20, 1957, 1.
- 51 **One of the lucky ones:** Mary Higgins Clark, *Kitchen Privileges: A Memoir* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2001); Mary Higgins Clark, “Edgar Smith—The Human Copperhead,” in *I, Witness: Personal Encounters with Crime by Members of the Mystery Writers of America*, edited by Brian Garfield (New York: Times Books, 1978), 245–56; author’s interviews with Mary Higgins Clark, January 30 and May 12, 2015.
- 52 **When Donald Hommell took the stand:** Testimony of Donald Hommell, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 308 (438a); *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 20, 1957, 2.
- 52 **Guy Calissi’s direct examination:** Testimony of Donald Hommell, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 309 (439a).
- 52 **The defense lawyer pressed Hommell:** Ibid., 313 (443a).

- 53 **Selser asked how many times:** Ibid., 314–15 (444a–445a).
- 53 **The adversarial relationship:** Ibid., 318–19 (448a–449a).
- 53 **Calissi took umbrage:** Ibid., 321 (451a).
- 53 **The lawyers sparred more:** Ibid., 321–25 (451a–455a).
- 54 **Selser returned to cross-examine:** Ibid., 325–35 (445a–465a).
- 54 **Selser then tried to ask:** Ibid.; no dental records or other documentation could be found to determine whether Edgar Smith had protruding teeth.
- 55 **Calissi had one last question:** Ibid., 335–36 (465a–466a).
- 55 **Before the day ended:** Testimony of Raphael Gilady, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 379–86 (509a–516a).
- 56 **It was not clear to Calissi:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 20, 1957, 1; testimony of the following law enforcement officials in *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*: Charles E. Smith, 387 (517a); Charles DeLisle, 388–91 (518a–521a); Henry Voss, 386–87 (517a–518a); Walter Spahr, 391–400 (521a–530a).
- 56 **Calissi and Selser’s sparring:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 403–09 (533a–539a).
- 56 **On the stand, under oath:** Testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 409–12 (539a–542a).
- 56 **As a rebuttal witness:** Testimony of Louis M. Kalstad, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 412–14 (542a–544a).
- 57 **After more back-and-forth:** Ibid., 414–21 (544a–551a); *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 21, 1957, 6.
- 57 **Calissi wrapped up his prosecution:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 501–12 (623a–634a).

6. “EDDIE AND DON AREN’T FRIENDS ANYMORE”

- 59 **This was the moment:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 23, 1957, 1; Associated Press, reprinted in the *Long Branch* [NJ] *Daily Record*, 8.
- 59 **Edgar’s wife and mother:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 23, 1957, 1.
- 59 **Selser first questioned Smith:** Testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 512–65 (634a–687a).

- 60 **Selser then asked:** *Ibid.*, 532–34 (654a–656a).
- 60 **Hommell got up abruptly:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 23, 1957, 1; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, May 23, 1957, 1.
- 61 **Reporters seemed to be:** *Rockland* [NY] *Journal-News*, May 23, 1957, 3; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 23, 1957, 1; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, May 23, 1957, 1.
- 61 **The next day, it was Guy Calissi’s turn:** Testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 565–664 (687a–786a).
- 61 **Edgar mostly stayed composed:** *Ibid.*, 645 (767a); *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 24, 1957, 1.
- 62 **Calissi asked if Edgar:** Testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 645–46 (767a–768a).
- 62 **Selser finally objected:** *Ibid.*, 646–47 (768a–769a).
- 62 **Next Selser called Rosella Wood:** Testimony of Rosella Wood, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 670–80 (792a–802a); *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 24, 1957, 2.
- 63 **Patricia Smith took the stand:** Testimony of Patricia Smith, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 691–716 (812a–838a); *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 24, 1957, 1.
- 63 **When Selser called Frank Gilg:** Testimony of Frank J. Gilg, *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 724–27 (846a–849a).
- 63 **It was clear to the audience:** *Rockland* [NY] *Journal-News*, May 25, 1957, 3.
- 64 **When Selser’s final two witnesses:** *Rockland* [NY] *Journal-News*, May 25, 1957, 1; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 25, 1957, 1.
- 64 **Edgar Smith’s trial had many dramatic moments:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 27, 1957, 1.
- 64 **Ruth Starr Zeitler:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 24, 1957, 1, May 27, 1957, 1, and May 28, 1957, 1.
- 65 **He was a star:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, May 27, 1957, 2, and May 28, 1957, 1.

- 65 **Ronald Marrone went on:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, September 5, 1957, 6, and October 15, 1971, 2; obituary on Ancestry.com notes that Marrone died in Cropwell, Alabama, on March 8, 2016.
- 65 **The swift arrest and charging:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 27, 1957, 1.
- 66 **John Selser went first:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 783–806 (905a–928a).
- 66 **Calissi began his summation:** *Ibid.*, 806–21 (928a–943a).
- 67 **The following morning:** *Ibid.*, 822–55 (944a–977a).

7. “IT CAN’T BE”

- 69 **Guy Calissi was taken aback:** *Daily News* (New York), May 29, 1957, 3.
- 69 **After the group of ten men:** Cited in *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 855 (977a).
- 69 **Edgar took it in:** *Newsday*, May 29, 1957, 1; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 29, 1957, 1.
- 69 **Judge O’Dea told the jurors:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 863–67 (985a–989a).
- 70 **Later, Anthony Zielinski told reporters:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, May 29, 1957, 1.
- 70 **Calissi was beyond tired:** *Ibid.*, 1.
- 70 **When a reporter:** *Ibid.*, 1.
- 70 **Selser was appalled:** *Ibid.*, 2.
- 71 **Just before he passed sentence:** *State of New Jersey v. Edgar Smith*, reprinted in Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 863–67 (985a–989a).

8. PATRICIA

- 75 **The last time Patricia Smith:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, July 8, 1957, 1, and August 6 1958, 1.
- 75 **She and Patti Ann fled:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 15, 1958, 1.
- 75 **Patricia was grateful:** *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, August 16, 1958, 3; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 15, 1958, 2.

- 76 **Patricia was, by the standards of the day:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 15, 1962, 41; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, June 2, 1958, 1, and March 2, 1962, 2.
- 76 **Edgar's cell was on the upper tier:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, June 2, 1958, 1, and March 2, 1962, 2.
- 76 **The Death House kept the inmates:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), July 20, 1957, 10; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, June 2, 1958, 3.
- 77 **For the Smiths' second wedding anniversary:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, June 4, 1958, 1; *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), June 4, 1958, 1; *Daily Home News* (New Brunswick, NJ), June 8, 1958, 1; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, June 9, 1958, 1.
- 77 **On June 25, 1958:** *State v. Smith*, 27 N.J. 433 (1958), Justia, <https://law.justia.com/cases/new-jersey/supreme-court/1958/27-n-j-433-0.html>; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), June 26, 1958, 2.
- 78 **John Selser swiftly announced:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, July 30, 1958, 1.
- 78 **But after a clemency hearing:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, July 31, 1958, 1.
- 78 **Selser, meanwhile, dropped:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 6, 1958, 1, and August 7, 1958, 1.
- 78 **In his affidavit:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 14, 1958, 2; *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 7, 1958, 1, and August 11, 1958, 1.
- 79 **The next few days:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 15, 1958, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 14, 1958, 2.
- 79 **The fourteen-witness, two-day hearing:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 15, 1958, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 14, 1958, 1.
- 79 **A US army private:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 14, 1958, 2.
- 79 **Pelzer, the bar owner:** *Ibid.*; *Paterson Evening News*, August 14, 1958; and *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 15, 1958, 1.
- 80 **Judge O'Dea wasn't swayed:** *Bergen [NJ] Evening Record*, August 15, 1958, 1.
- 80 **Patricia Smith rarely commented:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 15, 1958, 23; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, August 15, 1958, 1.
- 81 **Both Ann and Patricia planned:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 16, 1958, 3.
- 82 **If Patricia didn't know then:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 18, 1958, 2.

- 82 **The Death House was a spooky place:** Ibid., 2.
- 83 **The hours ticked by:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, August 18, 1958, 2.
- 83 **A member of the New Jersey Legislature:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, August 19, 1958, 2, and August 20, 1958, 2.
- 84 **Patricia was only dimly aware:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 19, 1958, 2.
- 84 **At around 3:00 p.m.:** Ibid.
- 84 **Judge Morrill had issued the stay:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, August 19, 1958, 1 and 2.
- 85 **Reporters pounced on the car:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 19, 1958, 2; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 19, 1958, 1.
- 85 **But as the news spread:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, August 20, 1958, 1 and 9.
- 86 **In the fall of 1955:** This section is sourced primarily from an affidavit Patricia gave to the Bergen County Prosecutor's Office in 2000 as part of its efforts to ensure that Edgar Smith would not be released from prison. The affidavit was included in Ronald Calissi's personal archives.

9. DIVORCES

- 89 **With the swift conviction:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 18, 1958, 1; Ramsey High School 1959 yearbook on Ancestry.com.
- 89 **The media coverage:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 18, 1958, 1, and August 19, 1958, 2.
- 90 **Vickie's father, Anthony:** *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, December 12, 1957, 1; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, December 18, 1957, 26.
- 90 **Mary finally filed for divorce:** *Zielinski v. Zielinski*, Superior Court of New Jersey, Chancery Division: Bergen County, Docket no. M-3587-58-R, filed August 5, 1959, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 7.
- 91 **The divorce was granted:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), October 2, 1959, 15.
- 91 **After the decree, Mary moved:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, June 30, 1960, 13; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 1, 1960, 5; Mary Jane Zielinski obituary, *Scranton* [PA] *Times-Tribune*, January 5, 2002, 26; "Divorce Decree or Dismissal Coupon" in re: *Mary Fay[e] Zielinski v. George Self*, Pulaski County, Arkansas, July 29, 1964.

- 91 **Anthony, meanwhile, remarried:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 30, 1977, 6, and January 20, 1983, 20.
- 91 **In public Patricia Smith remained:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, May 5, 1959, 1; *Bergen* [NJ] *Evening Record*, November 23, 1959, 1.
- 92 **“He didn’t kill her”:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, May 5, 1959, 1.
- 92 **After Judge Morrill died:** *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), March 14, 1961, 6.
- 92 **“DEAREST SMITTY”:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 16, 1960, 56.
- 93 **Eventually Patricia got involved:** *Reno Gazette-Journal*, June 28, 1962, 13, and January 1, 1963, 18; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, June 29, 1960, 11, and June 15, 1962, 1.
- 93 **Love, however, couldn’t quite make up:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, June 18, 1963, 19.
- 93 **Patricia was determined:** Author’s interview with “Patti Hafford,” September 10, 2019; EHS, letter to WFB, October 28, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 7.
- 93 **In the summer of 1962:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 5, 1962, 3, and August 1, 1962, 2.
- 94 **Edgar had been on death row:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), August 1, 1962, 1 and 35; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), August 1, 1962, 2; Associated Press, reprinted in the *Daily Home News* (New Brunswick, NJ), August 15, 1962, 30.
- 94 **When one of the condemned men:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, December 7, 1971, 12.
- 94 **Edgar was in legal limbo:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), September 6, 1962, 1.
- 95 **The new year brought more convicted men:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 4, 1964, 15.
- 95 **In the fall of 1962:** EHS, letter to WFB, October 28, 1963.
- 95 **He also obtained books:** *Ridgewood* [NJ] *Herald-News*, July 19, 1962, 1.

10. A “LIFETIME” SUBSCRIPTION

- 99 **When William F. Buckley, Jr., became interested:** This section is drawn primarily from John B. Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.: Patron Saint of the Conservatives* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1988), with additional biographical information gleaned from Alvin S. Felzenberg, *A*

- Man and His Presidents: The Political Odyssey of William F. Buckley, Jr.* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2018); Carl T. Bogus, *Buckley: William F. Buckley Jr. and the Rise of American Conservatism* (London: Bloomsbury Press, 2011); Richard Brookhiser, *Right Time, Right Place: Coming of Age with William F. Buckley Jr. and the Conservative Movement* (New York: Basic Books, 2009); Christopher Buckley, *Losing Mum and Pup: A Memoir* (New York: Twelve Books, 2009); and Nicholas Buccola, *The Fire Is Upon Us: James Baldwin, William F. Buckley Jr., and the Debate over Race in America* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2020).
- 99 **Also forthcoming was this 1980 assessment:** George Will, “Anniversary Salute,” *National Review*, December 31, 1980.
- 102 **Less than two years:** William F. Buckley, Jr., “Why the South Must Prevail,” *National Review*, August 24, 1957, 146; Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.*, 138.
- 102 **There were giant paradoxes:** Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.*, 38.
- 103 **“I don’t think I had”:** Ibid., 44.
- 104 **That ability, more than a decade:** Author’s interviews and conversations with Christopher Buckley, Aggie Dowd, Terry Teachout, and Sam Tanenhaus.
- 104 **It began with a newspaper column:** *Ridgewood* [NJ] *Herald-News*, July 19, 1962, 1; Donald G. M. Coxe, “Should Edgar Smith Be Executed?,” *National Review*, October 8, 1963.
- 105 **Buckley wrote Edgar a letter:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, September 28, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; WFB, telegram to EHS, September 26, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; EHS, letter to WFB, October 9, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 105 **Buckley sensed that Edgar’s plight:** Author’s interview with Donald G. M. Coxe, January 7, 2020.
- 105 **Though Coxe did not give up:** Ibid.
- 105 **Coxe’s application:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, September 28, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; William F. Buckley, Jr., “The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.,” *Esquire*, November 1, 1965, 116–21, 178–83.
- 106 **Cell 2455, Death Row:** Theodore Hamm, *Rebel and a Cause: Caryl Chessman and the Politics of the Death Penalty in Postwar California, 1948–1979* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).

- 106 **Edgar Smith and William F. Buckley corresponded:** EHS, letters to WFB, October 17, November 27, and December 13, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; WFB, letters to EHS, October 30 and December 20, 1962, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 107 **Buckley wrote again:** WFB, letter to EHS, January 18, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 107 **Coxe got his approval:** Author's interview with Donald G. M. Coxe, January 7, 2020.
- 108 **Six months earlier:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 28, 1960, 2, and January 23, 1960, 5.
- 108 **Edgar's latest appeal:** WFB, letters to EHS, July 25, August 13, August 30, and September 26, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; EHS, letters to WFB, July 26, August 26, and September 10 and 13, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 108 **Buckley, who was already leaning:** WFB, letter to EHS, September 26, 1963, WFBP Box 152, Folder 6; Coxe, "Should Edgar Smith Be Executed?"
- 109 **Coxe's piece did not garner:** Ibid.
- 109 **Edgar soon had another favor:** EHS, letter to WFB, October 14, 1963, and WFB, letter to EHS, October 17, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 109 **Buckley began to be drawn in:** EHS, letter to WFB, October 21, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 110 **Edgar then piled on:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 18, 1963, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.

11. "MY GOD, I WISH I COULD BE ABSOLUTELY CERTAIN"

- 111 **By 1964, William F. Buckley:** WFB, letter to EHS, March 25, 1964, and EHS, letter to WFB, March 25, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 111 **Buckley's outrage at the treatment:** WFB, letter to EHS, March 25, 1964; and EHS, letter to WFB, June 24, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 112 **Buckley had become more invested:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 17, 1964, and WFB, letter to EHS, March 3, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.

- 112 **In March, the court appointed:** EHS, letters to WFB, March 26 and April 3 and 8, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 17, 1964, 1.
- 112 **The habeas hearing took place:** EHS, letters to WFB, April 19 and May 10, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 112 **Edgar was even more upset:** *Escobedo v. State of Illinois*, Supreme Court 378 U.S. 478, 84, S. Ct. 1758, 12.L. Ed.2d.977, argued April 29, 1964, ruled on June 22, 1964, <https://www.law.cornell.edu/supremecourt/text/378/478>.
- 113 **Since Edgar hadn't been allowed:** *State v. Smith*, 202 A.2d 669 (N.J. 1964), <https://www.courtlistener.com/opinion/2187824/state-v-smith>; EHS, letter to WFB, July 13, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 113 **News that Buckley called:** *Wilmington [DE] Morning News*, June 11, 1964, 1; EHS, letter to WFB, June 14, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 113 **Edgar's newest appeal:** *State v. Smith*, 202 A.2d 669 (N.J. 1964); EHS, letters to WFB, July 13 and August 6, 1964, and WFB, letter to EHS, July 22 and August 5, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 114 **In August, though:** WFB, letters to EHS, August 10 and 18, 1964, and EHS, letter to WFB, August 20, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 114 **Edgar responded more sharply:** EHS, letter to WFB, September 12, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 115 **Then Edgar, for the first time:** Ibid.
- 116 **In his response, Buckley clarified:** WFB, letter to EHS, September 16, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 116 **Communication slowed:** WFB, letter to EHS, October 21, 1964, and EHS, letter to WFB, October 16, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 116 **Yet their friendship had become:** EHS, letters to WFB, October 22 and November 5, 1964, and WFB, letter to EHS, November 3, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 116 **Edgar filed his Supreme Court brief:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 23, 1964, and WFB, letter to EHS, November 30, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 117 **Buckley was later touched:** WFB, letters to EHS, December 16 and 22, 1964, and EHS, letter to WFB, December 18, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6.
- 117 **The more serious matter:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to WFB, December 24,

1964, and WFB, letter to EHS, December 31, 1964, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 6; EHS, letter to WFB, January 31, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 30, 1965, 3.

12. MEETING IN TRENTON

- 119 **William F. Buckley arrived:** William F. Buckley, Jr., “The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.,” *Esquire*, November 1, 1965, 116–21, 178–83; WFB, letters to EHS, February 8, 12, and 25, 1965, and WFB, telegram to EHS, March 16, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1; Nicholas Buccola, *The Fire Is Upon Us: James Baldwin, William F. Buckley Jr., and the Debate over Race in America* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2020), 244–45.
- 119 **What occupied Buckley’s mind:** EHS, letters to WFB, March 12 and 17, 1965, and WFB, letter to EHS, March 10, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 120 **When he got there:** Buckley, “The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.”
- 120 **Granted entrance:** Ibid.
- 124 **Edgar wrote Buckley:** EHS, letter to WFB, March 19, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 124 **The levity in Edgar’s letter:** Ibid.
- 124 **Judge O’Dea, however, denied:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 13, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1; Ann Chupak, letter to WFB, April 18, 1965, Box 153, Folder 2.
- 124 **Granting the stay on Good Friday:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 17, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 124 **Then part of his habitual mask dissolved:** Ibid.
- 125 **Buckley was preparing:** WFB, letter to EHS, April 27, 1965, and EHS, letter to WFB, May 1, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 125 **By May 13, Buckley had returned:** WFB, letter to EHS, May 13, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1; John B. Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.: Patron Saint of the Conservatives* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1988), 241.
- 125 **But he hadn’t forgotten Edgar:** WFB, letters to EHS, July 6 and 23 and August 11, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.

- 126 **"I was totally flabbergasted":** EHS, letter to WFB, July 21, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 126 **Edgar wrote again on August 1:** EHS, letter to WFB, August 1, 1965, and WFB, letter to EHS, August 5, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 127 **Much to the annoyance:** WFB, letter to EHS, August 17, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.

13. WAITING FOR DEATH

- 129 **The *Esquire* issue:** *Paterson Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), October 19, 1965, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), October 19, 1965, 1; William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.," *Esquire*, November 1, 1965, 116–21, 178–83.
- 129 **Reactions to Buckley's piece:** Ibid.
- 130 **The most specific and pointed critique:** EHS, letter to WFB, October 22, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 131 **Buckley did wonder why:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 4, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 131 **Edgar did seem to understand:** Ibid.
- 132 **Buckley responded:** WFB, letter to EHS, October 27, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 132 **Buckley could nitpick:** Ibid.
- 132 **Edgar assured Bill he was fine:** EHS, letters to WFB, November 1 and 9, 1965, and WFB, letter to EHS, November 3, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 133 **Buckley did not need that assurance:** WFB, memorandum to legal defense fund contributors, January 7, 1966, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 2; WFB, letter to EHS, November 29, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 133 **Buckley had also devoted:** The version titled "A Lonely Man Waits for Death" appeared in the *Daily Journal* (Franklin, IA), November 9, 1965, 2; titles for the column in other newspapers included "The Story of Edgar Smith," "In the Death House Is a Man Named Smith," and "The Death House—and Beyond."
- 134 **Buckley also mentioned the case:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 14, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.

- 134 **Two weeks after the column ran:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 23, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 134 **Buckley was confused by the news:** WFB, letter to EHS, November 23, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.
- 135 **“Guess what?”:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 2, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; *Miranda v. Arizona*, 384 US 436 (1966).
- 135 **Edgar had also heard rumors:** EHS, letter to WFB, August 4, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; *Millville* [NJ] *Daily*, April 29, 1966, 4.
- 135 **While waiting on a big move:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 2, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; *Miranda v. Arizona*, 384 US 436 (1966).
- 136 **“Eventually” was the key term here:** EHS, letter to WFB, July 7, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 136 **Buckley, who had just returned:** WFB, letter to EHS, August 10, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; *Firing Line* broadcasts are archived at the Hoover Institution on War, Revolution and Peace at Stanford University and online at <https://www.hoover.org/library-archives/collections/firing-line>.
- 137 **He had hoped to cheer Edgar up:** EHS, letters to WFB, July 26 and August 14, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 137 **Buckley also updated Edgar:** WFB, letter to EHS, August 11, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 137 **Edgar said he would try:** EHS, letters to WFB, August 14, 30, and 31, 1966, and WFB, letter to EHS, August 18, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 137 **Buckley had never:** WFB, letter to EHS, September 8, 1966, and EHS, letter to WFB, September 12, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 138 **The bulk of their correspondence:** EHS, letter to WFB, July 10, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; William F. Buckley, Jr. “New York at the Police Squad,” On the Right, July 19, 1966.
- 138 **The letter is worth considering:** EHS, letter to WFB, July 10, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5.
- 139 **On December 29:** EHS, letter to WFB, December 30, 1966, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 5; WFB, letter to Lloyd McCorkle, January 3, 1967, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.
- 140 **Even with no screen:** WFB, letter to Lloyd McCorkle, January 3, 1967, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.

- 140 **Edgar couldn't have cared less:** EHS, letter to WFB, January 6, 1967, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.
- 140 **The answer, as would become evident:** EHS, letter to WFB, December 20, 1965, WFBP, Box 153, Folder 1.

14. LUNCH AT PAONE'S

- 143 **Sophie Wilkins was anxious:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 14, 1967, SWP, Box 24; SCW, letter to WFB, November 15, 1967, WFBP, Box 46; SCW, letter to Sam Vaughan, September 5, 1978, SWP, Box 22, Folder 1.
- 143 **Sophie had first written to Buckley:** SCW, letter to WFB, October 28, 1965, WFBP, Box 78, Folder 11.
- 144 **Sophie had joined Alfred A. Knopf in 1959:** SCW, résumé, SWP, Box 23, Folder 15.
- 144 **Knopf was one of the most prestigious:** Charles McGrath, *Alfred A. Knopf, 1915–2015: A Century of Publishing* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2015); Gay Talese, "Random House Will Buy Knopf in Merger," *New York Times*, April 17, 1960, 1; Sam Roberts, "William Loverd, Who Promoted Literary Giants, Dies at 78," *New York Times*, June 19, 2019; Douglas Martin, "Ashbel Green, Longtime Editor at Knopf, Dies at 84," *New York Times*, September 19, 2012; Peter B. Flint, "Harold Strauss, Editor, Dead; Brought in Japanese Literature," *New York Times*, November 30, 1975, 73.
- 145 **She had emigrated from Vienna:** Biographical/historical note, SWP.
- 145 **Sophie was on her third marriage:** Marriage record for Sophie Prombaum and Meyer Klein, July 5, 1934, New York, New York Extracted Marriage Index, 1866–1937; marriage record for Sophie Prombaum and Alvin Meyer, May 1, 1942, Virginia Department of Health, Virginia, Marriages, 1936–2014; SCW, letter to EHS, October 3, 1967, SWP, Box 24; biographical/historical note, SWP; SCW, letter to WFB, September 24, 1979, SWP, Box 8, Folder 2; SCW, letter to Barbara Ehrenreich, February 9, 1985, SWP, Box 10, Folder 2.
- 145 **By 1967, her decade-long union:** Author's interview with Adam Wilkins, November 2018.
- 146 **Sophie's personality and demeanor:** Author's interviews with Kathy

- Hourigan, October 4, 2018; Toinette Lippe, January 6, 2019; Nancy Nicholas, October 5, 2018; and Anne McCormick, January 14, 2019.
- 146 **Sophie sensed commercial opportunity:** SCW, letter to Erle Stanley Gardner, March 22, 1965, SWP, Box 10, Folder 12; EHS, letter to WFB, August 11, 1967, Box 154, Folder 1.
 - 146 **What spurred Sophie:** SCW, letter to WFB, October 28, 1965, WFBP, MS 576, Series Part I, Box 46; SCW, letter to WFB, November 16, 1965; WFB, letter to SCW, November 22, 1965, WFBP, Box 78, Folder 11.
 - 147 **Sometime after Edgar mentioned:** EHS, letter to WFB, May 27, 1967, WFBP, Box 67; Ann Chupak, letter to SCW, May 23, 1967, and SCW, letter to Ann Chupak, May 25, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 1; SCW, letter to EHS, July 26, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 2.
 - 147 **By November, their strictly professional correspondence:** EHS, letter to SCW, October 11, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5; SCW, letter to EHS, October 17, 1967; EHS, letter to SCW, October 21, 1967.
 - 147 **At Paone's, she expected:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 14, 1967, SWP, Box 24; SCW, letters to WFB, November 15 and 24, 1967, WFBP, Box 78, Folder 11; SCW, letter to WFB, June 3–6, 1988, SWP, Box 8, Folder 3.
 - 147 **By the end of the lunch:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "Sophie Wilkins, R.I.P.," *National Review*, June 2, 2003, 14.
 - 148 **"For me, it was":** SCW, letter to WFB, SWP, Box 8, Folder 3.
 - 148 **Two decades later:** SCW, letter to WFB, July 4, 1998, SWP, Box 6, Folder 5; EHS, letter to SCW, October 11, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.

15." THEY MUST THINK I AM HOUDINI"

- 149 **She'd learned from Ann Chupak:** SCW, postcard to EHS, December 27, 1967, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1; Ann Chupak, letters to SCW, May 23 and 28 and June 11, 1967, SWP and SCW, letters to Ann Chupak, May 25 and June 13, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 1.
- 150 **There was one more unexpected complication:** EHS, letter to SCW, July 24, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.

- 150 **Edgar was also considering:** Ibid.
- 151 **As promised, Edgar's subsequent letter:** EHS, letter to SCW, July 24, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.
- 151 **Edgar's letters met:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.
- 151 **She also thought that getting an agent:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to SCW, August 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.
- 152 **Sophie also made one early:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.
- 152 **In other early letters:** EHS, letter to SCW, September 7, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 153 **"Hello, my wide-eyed, liberal friend":** EHS, letter to SCW, August 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 4.
- 153 **Sophie had, in one:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 26, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 3.
- 153 **Edgar walked the comments back:** EHS, letter to SCW, August 6, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 4.
- 154 **After Sophie described:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 23, 1967, SWP and EHS, letter to SCW, August 31, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 4.
- 154 **That was a prelude:** EHS, letter to SCW, September 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 4.
- 154 **Sophie would later claim:** SCW, letter to WFB, July 4, 1998, SWP, Box 6, Folder 5.
- 155 **"Why are you so special?":** EHS, letter to SCW, September 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 155 **On October 5, Sophie wrote:** SCW, letter to EHS, October 5, 1967, and EHS, letter to SCW, October 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 155 **Three days later, on October 8:** EHS, letter to SCW, October 8, 1967, SWP and SCW, letter to EHS, October 9, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 156 **She knew the score:** SCW, letter to EHS, October 9, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 156 **Edgar was having none:** EHS, letter to SCW, October 11, 1967, SWP and EHS, letter to SCW, October 21, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.

- 156 **Sophie, meanwhile, repeated:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 156 **The correspondence got hotter:** EHS, letters to SCW, November 11, 21, and 25, 1967, and SCW, letter to EHS, November 23, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 157 **Edgar joked:** EHS, letters to SCW, November 1 and 5, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 157 **When they did meet:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 12, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.

16. BLOOD, NERVES, VIBRATIONS

- 159 **He was frustrated:** EHS, letter to SCW, September 7, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 159 **By October 3, Sophie's enthusiasm:** SCW, letter to EHS, October 3, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 159 **Three weeks later:** EHS, letter to SCW, October 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5.
- 160 **He instructed his mother:** EHS, letter to SCW, October 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 5; SCW, memorandum, November 16, 1967, AAKR, Box 924, Folder 5.
- 160 **She felt the structure:** SCW, memorandum, November 16, 1967, WFBP, Box 57, Folder 1; SCW, letter to EHS, November 23, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 160 **Sophie was at last:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 12, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6; EHS, letter to SCW, November 11, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 161 **Then he appeared:** Ibid.
- 161 **Sophie felt awkward:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 12, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 161 **Edgar, however, had:** EHS, letter to SCW, November 11, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 162 **Sophie felt compelled:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 12, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 162 **But she determined:** SCW, letters to EHS, November 12 and 24, 1967, SWP and SCW, letter to Ann Chupak, December 3, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.

- 162 **The mask behind which:** EHS, letter to SCW, November 25, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 163 **The dark cloud apparently lifted:** EHS, letter to SCW, December 2, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 163 **The correspondence deepened:** SCW, letter to EHS, December 8, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 163 **At Christmas, Edgar sent her:** EHS, letters to SCW, December 20, 22, and 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 6.
- 164 **Sophie was flattered and thrilled:** SCW, letter to EHS, January 2, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 7.

17. HATKIC

- 165 **Sophie Wilkins began the New Year:** SCW, letters to EHS, January 2, 3, and 6, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 7; author's interview with Adams Wilkins, December 2018.
- 165 **"Your colors remind me":** SCW, letter to EHS, January 2, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 165 **Edgar was pressing her:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to SCW, December 28, 1967, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 166 **Sophie preferred to write:** Referencing SCW letter to EHS, January 6, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8: "My Eddie, by today you will have gotten my letters from 3 I, and the 2 from 4 I, and maybe the 4 pieces of mail I sent out to you yesterday!"
- 166 **Sophie, perhaps as a means:** Ibid.
- 167 **Sophie visited Edgar again:** EHS, letter to SCW, January 20, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 167 **Writing three days later:** SCW, letter to EHS, January 23, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 167 **More nicknames proliferated:** EHS, letters to SCW, February 8 and 25, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 167 **The nickname he preferred:** EHS, letter to SCW, February 26, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 167 **"Soitanly!":** EHS, letter to SCW, May 5, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.

- 168 **Bubbling under the professions:** EHS mentioned the “hatkic” letters in a letter to SCW, February 28, 1968: “Epic on the way to Steve, with some trepidation on my part.” SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 168 **But there was no page limit:** The “hatkic” epics that have survived run well past a dozen pages each.
- 168 **Though the first such “epic”:** EHS, reference to letter to SCW, February 8, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 169 **It isn’t clear:** EHS, letter to SCW, January 20, 1968, SWP, Box 24, Folder 8.
- 169 **Edgar had made a point:** Ibid.
- 169 **Many years later:** SCW, letter to WFB, March 9, 1973, SWP, Box 6, Folder 4.
- 169 **One characteristic example:** EHS, letter to SCW, April 20, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 8.
- 171 **And on Edgar went:** Ibid.
- 171 **Sophie, in later years:** SCW, letter to WFB, July 4, 1998, SWP, Box 6, Folder 5.

18. MARCH TO PUBLICATION

- 173 **In January 1968, Sophie wrote:** SCW, memorandum, January 24, 1968, SWP, Box 23, Folder 15.
- 174 **Then she passed:** Angus Cameron, memorandum, February 1968, SWP, Box 23, Folder 15.
- 174 **In early February, Sophie spoke:** Robert Lescher, letter to SCW, February 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1; WFB, letter to EHS, September 13, 1967, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.
- 174 **Over the next nine pages:** Robert Lescher, letter to SCW, February 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1.
- 175 **Sophie visited Edgar on February 8:** EHS, letter to SCW, February 8, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1.
- 175 **Edgar took the agent’s comments:** Ibid.
- 176 **Change was in the air:** Henry Raymont, “Knopf Hires 3 Top Aides of Simon & Schuster; Gottlieb, Chief Editor, Leaving with Anthony Schulte and Nina Bourne,” *New York Times*, January 6, 1968, 26.

- 176 **She had allies:** Author's interview with Kathy Hourigan, October 4, 2018; SCW, letter to EHS, February 21, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1.
- 177 **Before Sophie could formally present:** Arthur Abelman, letter to SCW, February 26, 1968, AAKR, Box 924, Folder 5; SFL, letter to EHS, March 8, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1; EHS, letter to WFB, March 3, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.
- 177 **"Every time I try to write or think":** EHS, letter to SCW, March 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1.
- 177 **Then he went in for the kill:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to WFB, March 6, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1.
- 177 **Sophie attempted to soothe:** SCW, letter to EHS, March 9, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 1.
- 178 **The spring proved to be vital:** Robert Gottlieb, letter to SCW, March 17, 1968, AAKR and SCW, letter to Robert Gottlieb, March 18, 1968, AAKR, Box 924, Folder 5.
- 178 **When Sophie floated the idea:** EHS, letters to SCW, March 28 and April 1, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 179 **He also joked:** EHS, letter to SCW, March 28, 1968, and SCW, letter to EHS, March 29, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2. In addition, the author relayed this anecdote to Tommy Trantino in an interview in 2019; he laughed and said he did not recall the exchange but did remember SCW fondly (and EHS less so).
- 179 **Edgar made one more impassioned case:** EHS, letter to SCW, April 1, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 180 **Whatever he thought:** Ibid.
- 180 **Perhaps that's why:** EHS, letter to SCW, April 4, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 180 **Sophie seemed taken aback:** SCW, letter to EHS, April 6, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 180 **Soon Edgar sent Sophie another:** EHS, letter to SCW, April 20, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 8; EHS, letter to SCW, April 28, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 180 **But Sophie didn't seem to mind:** Signed contract, AAKR, Box 924, Folder 5. For the history of "Son of Sam" laws, see "1105. The First Amendment Problems of 'Son of Sam' Laws," Criminal Resource Manual 1101-1199, Department of Justice Archives, <https://www>

.justice.gov/archives/jm/criminal-resource-manual-1105-first-amendment-problems-son-sam-laws.

- 181 **Sophie was also preoccupied:** SCW, letter to EHS, May 9, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 181 **Edgar asked if his mother could attend:** Ibid.
- 181 **There was another surprise guest:** WFB, letter to EHS, March 27, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 182 **Sophie's presentation:** SCW, letter to EHS, May 9, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3; Anthony Schulte, letter to SCW, May 10, 1968, WFBP, Box 57, Folder 1; Anthony Schulte, letter to WFB, May 11, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 182 **Sophie, of course, expressed:** SCW, letter to WFB, May 10, 1968, WFBP, Box 57, Folder 1.
- 183 **After the meeting:** SCW, letter to EHS, May 10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 183 **Five days later:** EHS, letter to SCW, May 14, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 183 **She visited again:** EHS, letter to SCW, May 26, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3; EHS, letter to WFB, May 14, 1968, WFBP, 276, Folder 9.
- 183 **That proved to be:** EHS, letter to SCW, May 28, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 184 **He wrote Sophie on May 29:** EHS, letter to SCW, May 29, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 184 **She, in turn, apologized:** SCW, letter to EHS, May 26, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 184 **Sophie kept herself abreast:** SCW, letter to EHS, June 23, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 185 **Buckley was delighted:** WFB, letter to EHS, May 23, 1968, WFB-Pand EHS, letter to WFB, May 25, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 185 **Buckley finally read:** WFB, letter to EHS, May 29, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 185 **The note confused Edgar:** Ibid.
- 185 **Sophie's next visit:** EHS, letter to SCW, June 16, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.

- 186 **Sophie read that letter:** SCW, letter to EHS, June 18, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 186 **They patched things up:** The Editors, "September Books," *Publishers Weekly*, June 3, 1968, 73; SCW, letter to EHS, June 26, 1968, and EHS, letter to SCW, June 27, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 3.
- 186 **Capote, however, did read:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 187 **Edgar replied right away:** EHS, letter to SCW, July 11, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4; William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Protracted Life of Edgar Smith," *Life*, February 1979, 54–71.
- 187 **Otherwise, Edgar spent:** *Witherspoon v. Illinois*, 391 U.S. 510 (1968), decided by the Supreme Court on June 3, 1968; WFB letter to EHS, July 11, 1968, SWP and EHS, letter to SCW, July 22, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4; SMU, letter to EHS, July 29, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2
- 188 **On August 2, Sophie received:** EHS, letter to SCW, August 4, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.

19. THE BREACH

- 189 **July 1968 was a good month:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 25, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 189 **Edgar also received:** SMU, letter to EHS, July 29, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4; EHS, letter to SCW, August 3, 1968, and EHS, letter to WFB, August 3, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 190 **But the very next day:** EHS, letter to SCW, August 4, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 190 **Edgar told Sophie:** Ibid.
- 191 **Sophie, upon receiving the letter:** SCW, letter to SFL, August 6, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 191 **She followed up with Lichtenstein:** Ibid.
- 192 **Then she set about:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 6, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 192 **Until the matter was sorted out:** Ibid.
- 192 **A few days later:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 8, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.

- 193 **Sophie wrote to Steve Lichtenstein again:** SCW, letter to SFL, August 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 193 **If Edgar did go ahead:** Ibid.
- 194 **That same Wednesday:** EHS, letter to SCW, August 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 194 **The entire letter must have been:** Ibid.
- 194 **The letter gained him no traction:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 8, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 195 **Sophie wondered if her reaction:** Ibid.
- 195 **Yet within two weeks:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 25, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 195 **Edgar at last realized:** EHS, letter to WFB, August 8, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 195 **A few days later:** WFB, letter to EHS, August 15, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9; SCW, letter to WFB, August 13, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 196 **Buckley hadn't understood:** John B. Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.: Patron Saint of the Conservatives* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1988), 288–93.
- 196 **"It is quite true":** WFB, letter to EHS, August 15, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 196 **Edgar's mood also improved:** EHS, letter to WFB, August 19, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 197 **A week later, on August 26:** WFB, letter to EHS, August 26, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9; SCW, to EHS, August 27, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 197 **Neither Sophie nor Edgar, it seemed:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 197 **A long letter:** EHS, letter to SCW, August 9–10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 197 **For Buckley had read:** WFB, telegram to EHS, August 10, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 1; EHS, letter to SCW, August 9–10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 198 **Edgar also wrote:** SCW, letter to EHS, August 14, 1968, and SCW, letter to SFL, August 17, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.

- 198 **Sophie couldn't help admitting:** SCW, letter to SFL, August 17, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 4.
- 198 **Edgar, however, would remain:** SCW, letter to EHS, September 4, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.

20. BRIEF AGAINST DEATH

- 200 **Naturally, local newspapers reached out:** *Morning Call* (Paterson, NJ), September 5, 1968, 42.
- 200 **Edgar was curious:** EHS, letters to SCW, September 3 and 5, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.
- 201 **Edgar was pleased with the reviews:** Ruth Blum, "Smith: Killer? Genius?," *Sunday News* (Ridgewood, NJ), September 22, 1968, 1; Mark Howat, "Death Row's Smith Raises Some Doubts," *Record* (Bergen, NJ), September 4, 1968, 1; Christopher Lehmann-Haupt, "Books of the Times; Life and Times of a Victim," *New York Times*, September 3, 1968, 41; Ross MacDonald, "Eddie's Story," *New York Times Book Review*, September 22, 1968, 8; WFB, letter to EHS, September 5, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 201 **Edgar also looked forward:** EHS, letters to SCW, September 3 and 5, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.
- 201 **After Edgar watched his friend:** EHS, letter to WFB, September 4, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 201 **Buckley also appeared:** SFL, letter to EHS, September 6, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5; transcript of WNEW program, September 5, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 202 **Buckley dismissed the judgment:** Transcript of interview by Lloyd Dobyns, WNEW, September 5, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 202 **Edgar's postpublication letters:** EHS, letters to SCW, September 3 and 5, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.
- 202 **Sophie reacted to the book's publication:** SCW, letter to EHS, September 7, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.
- 203 **The day before, Sophie had returned:** EHS, letter to SCW, September 14, 1968, and SCW, letter to EHS, September 15, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 5.

- 203 **By October 10, two days after:** SCW, letter to EHS, October 10, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6; WFB, letter to EHS, October 11, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 203 **A week later, Sophie and Buckley rejoiced:** SCW, letter to WFB, October 18, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9.
- 203 **The good book news helped alleviate:** WFB, letter to EHS, October 5, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; SMU, letter to EHS, October 29, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 204 **It turned out that the Supreme Court:** SFL, letter to EHS, October 30, 1968, WFBP, Box 276, Folder 9; EHS, letter to SCW, November 5, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 204 **Then came the big shock:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 12, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 204 **Edgar was understandably ecstatic:** EHS, letter to SCW, November 12, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 205 **Buckley saw no reason:** WFB, telegram to EHS, November 12, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; WFB, letter to EHS, November 18, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 205 **Umin went even further:** SMU, letter to EHS, with comments by SCW, November 12, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 205 **With the clock restarted:** EHS, letter to SCW, November 13, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 206 **He also implored Steve Lichtenstein:** WFB, letter to SFL, December 16, 1968, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 206 **Edgar also wondered:** EHS, letter to SCW, November 13, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 206 **As 1968 drew to a close:** EHS, letter to SCW, December 8, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.
- 206 **"I am reimpressed":** SCW, letter to EHS, December 20, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.

21. ROGUE'S WAKE

- 209 **For Sophie Wilkins, 1968 had been:** SCW, letter to EHS, November 22, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6.

- 209 **Edgar, however, didn't share:** EHS, letter to SCW, December 22, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6; EHS, letter to WFB, March 10, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 210 **In 1957, Juliette had been living:** Juliette Scheinman, letter to SCW, undated (ca. 1969), SWP, Box 25, Folder 6; author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019.
- 210 **Her life had changed:** Author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 22, 1961, 13; Juliette Scheinman obituary, *New York Times*, September 18, 2013; Tom Wolfe, "Radical Chic: That Party at Lenny's," *New York*, July 29, 1970, https://nymag.com/docs/07/05/070529radical_chic.pdf.
- 211 **The two women went out:** Juliette Scheinman, letter to SCW, undated (ca. 1969), SWP, Box 25, Folder 6. SCW lived at 211 West 106th Street, and Scheinman lived on West End Avenue near Lincoln Center.
- 211 **"Watch your step":** SCW, comments, relayed in a letter from EHS to WFB, January 19, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 212 **Her love of Bloomingdale's:** Author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019; EHS, letter to WFB, January 19, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8; WFB, letters to EHS, January 17 and February 10, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 212 **Edgar's increased attention:** EHS, letter to SCW, December 22, 1968, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6; EHS, letter to WFB, January 28, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 213 **Conditions on death row:** Undated ad for Sears portable typewriter with EHS handwriting indicating that he now had one of his own; SWP, Box 25, Folder 7.
- 213 **But then his progress:** EHS, letter to SCW, January 5, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 7.
- 213 **Sophie also decided:** Author's interview with Adam Wilkins, December 21, 2018; SCW, letter to EHS, January 7, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 7; SCW, letter to WFB, January 27, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1; EHS, letter to WFB, April 26, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 214 **What Sophie didn't know:** EHS, letters to WFB, January 12 and February 20, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 214 **Sophie's letters, meanwhile:** SCW, letter to EHS, January 16, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 7.

- 214 **A week later, on January 23:** SCW, letter to EHS, January 23, 1969; SWP, Box 25, Folder 7.
- 215 **Sophie claimed:** Ibid.
- 215 **Edgar, too, had reached:** EHS, letter to SCW, January 26, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 7.
- 215 **They did not keep the change:** SCW, letters to WFB, January 27 and February 8, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1; EHS, letter to WFB, January 31, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8; WFB, letter to SCW, February 4, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1.
- 216 **She begged to differ:** SCW, letter to WFB, January 24, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1.
- 216 **Edgar also saw the value:** Correspondence between EHS and SCW, SWP, Box 25, Folders 7–10.
- 216 **The timing also likely coincided:** SCW, letter to WFB, April 2, 1969, WFBP, EHS, letter to WFB, April 5, 1969, and WFB, letter to EHS, April 15, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1; EHS, letter to WFB, April 30, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 216 **After prison officials intercepted:** EHS, letter to Juliette Scheinman, June 8, 1969, included with materials provided by the Bergen County Prosecutor's Office opposing EHS's bid for parole, 2000.
- 217 **The loss of uncensored mail transmission:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 30, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 217 **What with the many months:** EHS, letters to WFB, April 30 and May 5, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 217 **After the confiscated letter fracas:** EHS, letter to WFB, June 18, 1969, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; Judge O'Dea, ruling, June 5, 1969, and his later revocation, June 15, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 218 **The following month:** Walter H. Waggoner, "George H. Barlow, U.S. Judge, 58," *New York Times*, March 6, 1979, B6; Orin Kerr, "Judge Leonard I. Garth: 1921–2016," *Washington Post*, September 26, 2016; EHS, letter to WFB, July 23, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 218 **Despite the reduction:** SCW, memorandum, January 23, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 2.
- 219 **William F. Buckley told Edgar:** WFB, letter to SCW, March 26, 1969, WFBP, Box 67, Folder 1; WFB, letter to EHS, September 17, 1969, and EHS letter to WFB, September 10, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.

- 219 **And was *A Reasonable Doubt*:** EHS, letter to WFB, June 1, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 219 **Juliette Scheinman also read:** EHS, letters to WFB, September 10 and 14, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 220 **What Edgar may have suspected:** SCW, editorial letter, October 1969, and Robert Gottlieb, rejection letter, October 24, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 9.
- 220 **But Gottlieb wasn't ready:** Robert Gottlieb, rejection letter, October 24, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 9.
- 220 **Since Knopf didn't want to commit:** EHS, letters to WFB, October 25 and 29, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8; Jack Geoghegan, letter to Robert Lescher, November 12, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 10; Robert Lescher, letter to EHS, November 14, 1969, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 6.
- 220 **The company was so enthusiastic:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 12, 1969, and WFB, letter to EHS, November 13, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8; Jack Geoghegan, letter to Robert Lescher, November 12, 1969, SWP, Box 25, Folder 10.
- 221 **Edgar was fine with that suggestion:** EHS, letter to Robert Lescher, November 15, 1969, WFBP, Box 79, Folder 2; EHS, letter to Jack Geoghegan, November 21, 1969, and EHS, letter to Robert Lescher, December 5, 1969, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 6.
- 221 **It was a good way to close:** EHS, letter to WFB, December 4, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.
- 221 **He had alienated Sophie romantically:** WFB, letter to EHS, December 1, 1969, WFB, telegram to EHS, December 17, 1969, and EHS, letter to WFB, December 28, 1969, WFBP, Box 152, Folder 8.

22. A REASONABLE DOUBT

- 223 **Edgar Smith felt frustrated:** EHS, letters to WFB, February 11 and 19, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; SMU, letter to Judge George H. Barlow, February 6, 1970, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239; SMU, letter to Judge George H. Barlow, February 14, 1970, SMU, letter to EHS, February 20, 1970, EHS, letter to Judge George H. Barlow, February

- 25, 1970, SFL, letter to EHS, February 27, 1970, and EHS, letter to SFL, February 28, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 223 **Barlow wrote back:** Judge George H. Barlow, letter to SMU, March 3, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 224 **Umin successfully angled for:** SMU, letter to EHS, March 10, 1970, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239; EHS, letter to WFB, April 2, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 224 **Edgar ended up spending:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 17, 1970, WFBP, Box Box 154, Folder 2.
- 224 **But, he admitted to Buckley:** EHS, letter to WFB, April 19, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 225 **Edgar, wearing his new suit:** *Sunday News* (Ridgewood, NJ), April 19, 1970, 1; EHS, letter to WFB, May 2, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; EHS, letter to WFB, April 21, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 225 **Edgar was back in court:** EHS, letter to SMU, May 3, 1970, and EHS, letter to Frances Bronson, May 11, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7; EHS, letter to WFB, May 11, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 225 **Though Steve Umin argued valiantly:** EHS, letters to WFB, May 11 and August 5, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 226 **Edgar's legendary imperturbability:** EHS, letters to WFB, September 26 and October 3, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 226 **Smith's screed understandably caused:** WFB, telegram to EHS, October 7, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; SMU, letter to WFB, October 7, 1970, and WFB, letter to SMU, October 22, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 227 **True, the friendship between:** Author's interview with David Quammen, December 28, 2018; SCW, letter to WFB, June 12, 1970, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2411.
- 227 **Sophie and Bill's championing:** SCW, letter to Henry Robbins, June 5, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7; SCW, letter to WFB, May 18, 1970, WFB, letter to SCW, June 3, 1970, and EHS, letter to SCW, June 4, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 24, 1970, 9; *New York Times*, July 23, 1970, 27.
- 227 **Perhaps Sophie's work:** EHS, letter to WFB, September 13, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.

- 227 **Sophie, however, felt:** SCW, letters to WFB, April 14 and May 18, 1970, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2411.
- 227 **Edgar Smith's first novel:** EHS, letter to WFB, July 26, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 228 **Steve Umin's colleague:** David Webster, letter to EHS, July 31, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7; WFB, letter to EHS, August 6, 1970, and EHS, letter to WFB, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 228 **The public reception:** Allan Hubin, "Criminals at Large," *New York Times Book Review*, October 4, 1970, 14; Anonymous, "A Reasonable Doubt," *Kirkus Reviews*, August 1, 1970; EHS, letter to Agatha Schmidt, August 13, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 229 **The capper was a blurb:** EHS, letter to WFB, August 28, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 229 **With so much publicity:** EHS, letter to WFB, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; Steven M. Umin, letter to WFB, August 4, 1970, and WFB, letter to Jack Kroll, August 13, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 229 **"There is, to begin with":** EHS, letter to Albert C. Wagner, August 3, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7.
- 230 **The letter didn't work:** SMU, letter to EHS, August 4, 1970, WFBP, Box 155, Folder 7; EHS, letters to WFB, October 3 and 22, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2; Richard Lingeman, "From the Pen of Edgar Smith," *New York Times Book Review*, December 13, 1970, 8; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), November 8, 1970, 117.
- 230 **Edgar enjoyed the praise:** EHS, letter to WFB, September 29, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 230 **Good legal news came unexpectedly:** WFB, telegram to EHS, October 7, 1970, EHS, letters to WFB, December 2 and 31, 1970, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.

23. BID FOR A NEW TRIAL

- 231 **Beginning on January 18, 1971:** *Bulletin* (Philadelphia), January 17, 1971, XB-3; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24.
- 232 **The Newark courtroom:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24; WFB, letter to EHS, January 18, 1971, and EHS, letter to WFB, January 23, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3; author's interview with Bill

- Scheinman, November 16, 2019; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 1, 1971, 2; SCW, letter to EHS, January 20, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 232 **The press, not only:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), January 19, 1971, 1; *Daily News* (New York), January 19, 1971, 7; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 1.
- 232 **The day before the hearing:** *Bulletin* (Philadelphia), January 17, 1971, XB-3.
- 232 **When Knight asked:** Ibid.
- 233 **On the first day:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, January 19, 1971, 1.
- 233 **The prosecutors had made:** Ibid.
- 233 **It was up to Judge Gibbons:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 11, 1971, 4.
- 233 **Gibbons, a slender man:** Ibid.
- 234 **The hearing often seemed:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, January 19, 1971, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 11, 1971, 4.
- 234 **Fred Galda, then an assistant prosecutor:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), January 19, 1971, 2; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 19, 1971, 24.
- 234 **Walter Spahr, flown in:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), January 19, 1971, 2, and January 20, 1971, 2; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, January 20, 1971, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 20, 1971, 7.
- 235 **Spahr, sporting a blue sports jacket:** Ibid.
- 235 **The next day, Judge Gibbons:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), January 21, 1971, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 21, 1971, 1.
- 236 **The tape was cued up and played:** Ibid.
- 236 **Judge Gibbons had to adjourn:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 24, 1971 11, and January 25, 1971, 20; EHS, letter to WFB, January 30, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 237 **The hearing resumed:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 1, 1971, 2; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 2, 1971, 9.
- 237 **The following day:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 3, 1971, 2; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 3, 1971, 7.
- 237 **Calissi was then cross-examined:** Ibid.

- 238 **When it restarted:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 9, 1971, B4; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 10, 1971, 6; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, February 10, 1971, 43.
- 238 **Edgar, accompanied by two guards:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 11, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 238 **When asked about his statement:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 10, 1971, 6; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, February 10, 1971, 43; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 10, 1971, 1.
- 239 **Fitzpatrick, on cross, pressed Edgar:** Ibid.
- 239 **Edgar was the last:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 10, 1971, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 11, 1971, 3; *Central New Jersey Home News*, February 11, 1971, 57.
- 239 **Webster and Umin were optimistic:** SMU, letter to WFB, January 27, 1971, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239; Edgar Smith, "A Pre-Posthumous Conversation with Myself," *Esquire*, June 1, 1971, 14–20.
- 239 **On May 14:** *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, May 14, 1971, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), May 14, 1971, 1.

24. CONVICTION OVERTURNED

- 241 **Steve Lichtenstein had the honor:** *Asbury Park [NJ] Press*, May 15, 1971, 1; EHS, letter to Frances Bronson, May 18, 1971, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 241 **To Buckley, he quipped:** EHS, letter to WFB, May 14, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 241 **Ann declined to speak:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), May 16, 1971, 2; Frances Bronson, letter to SCW, May 18, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 242 **Bergen County prosecutor Robert Dilts:** *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, May 14, 1971, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 20, 1971, 1.
- 242 **A Bergen *Record* reporter:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), May 16, 1971, 2.
- 243 **He told the reporter:** Ibid.
- 243 **Miami *Herald* reporter Ann Wilder:** *Miami Herald*, reprinted in the *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 27, 1971, 1.

- 243 **Then there was the whole business:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), August 12, 1964, 3; *Wilmington* [DE] *Morning News*, August 12, 1964, 1.
- 243 **But the judge:** *Wilmington* [DE] *Morning News*, February 11, 1965, 1.
- 244 **Hommell emphasized that Edgar's story:** *Miami Herald*, reprinted in the *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 27, 1971, 1.
- 244 **Hommell's bitterness and preoccupation:** *Greenville* [SC] *News*, January 12, 1979, 2. Hommell did not respond to repeated interview requests by email and telephone for this book.
- 244 **At a June 8 hearing in Newark:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 8, 1971, 2, and June 9, 1971, 1; WFB, letter to EHS, June 1, 1971, and draft document of Smith's eventual appearance on *Firing Line*, June 9, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 245 **The following morning:** *Central New Jersey Home News*, June 9, 1971, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), June 10, 1971, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 10, 1971, 1.
- 245 **The Bergen Record ran:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 10, 1971, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), June 10, 1971, 1; EHS, letter to WFB, June 11, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3; EHS, letter to Frances Bronson, June 15, 1971, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 245 **He hoped the book:** EHS, letter to SMU, June 23, 1971, and EHS, letter to Robert Lescher, July 13, 1971, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083; EHS, letter to SCW, July 27, 1971, SWP, Box 20, Folder 15.
- 245 **He was far more interested:** EHS, letters to WFB, March 6, 1971, April 23 and 30, 1971, and June 23 and 29, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 246 **On August 2:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 3, 1971, 1; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), August 3, 1971, 1; EHS, letter to SMU, August 5, 1971, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 246 **Edgar kept sending:** EHS, letters to SMU, August 5, 8, 24, and 30, 1971, SFL, letter to SMU, August 18, 1971, and SMU, letter to EHS, August 26, 1971, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239.
- 247 **Buckley, too, was taken aback:** WFB, letter to SMU, August 31, 1971, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239.
- 247 **Umin responded with gratitude:** SMU, letter to WFB, September 10, 1971, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239.
- 247 **Edgar's ire against his lawyer:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), October 12, 1971, 1.

- 247 **As Edgar's life took:** SCW, letter to EHS, July 18, 1971, SWP, Box 20, Folder 15; EHS, letter to WFB, June 27, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 248 **Sophie was devastated:** Ibid.; SCW, letter to WFB, March 9, 1971, and SCW, letter to WFB, November 2, 1971, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–3; SCW letter to EHS, July 18, 1971, SWP, Box 20, Folder 15.
- 248 **Her depression didn't lift:** SCW, letter to WFB, November 2, 1971, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–3.
- 248 **Sophie once described:** SCW, letter to WFB, November 29, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 249 **The mood in Bergen County:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), October 15, 1971, 2 and 18.
- 249 **Which was why Edgar pressed:** EHS, letters to WFB, September 11 and 17, 1971, and WFB, letters to EHS, September 14 and October 11, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 249 **His lawyers believed:** EHS, letters to WFB, October 24 and 31, 1971, and November 9 and 15, 1971, and WFB, telegrams to EHS, November 3 and 12, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 249 **He grumbled and griped:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to SCW, October 28, 1971, SWP, Box 20, Folder 15; SMU, letter to EHS, November 15, 1971, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239.
- 250 **He was especially disgruntled:** EHS, letter to WFB, November 22, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.
- 250 **All of which led:** Ibid.; Edgar Smith, *Getting Out* (New York: Coward, McCann & Geoghegan, 1973), 239.

25. NON VULT

- 253 **On December 6, 1971:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 6, 1971, 1.
- 253 **The courtroom was packed:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 7, 1971, 1; *Bulletin* (Philadelphia), December 7, 1971, 1; *New York Times*, December 7, 1971, 1.
- 253 **When Edgar, dressed in a dark suit:** Edgar Smith, *Getting Out* (New York: Coward, McCann & Geoghegan, 1973), 226–29; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 7, 1971, 1.

- 254 **Edgar's voice was nearly inaudible:** Ibid.
- 254 **Judge Pashman then handed down:** *New York Times*, December 7, 1971, 1.
- 255 **Two vehicles—a limousine:** Author's interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 7, 1971, 1.
- 255 **Edgar answered some of the questions:** Smith, *Getting Out*, 236–37.
- 256 **Buckley took off his jacket:** Ibid.
- 256 **Buckley and Edgar agreed:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Protracted Life of Edgar Smith," *Life*, February 1979, 54–70.
- 256 **The limousine arrived:** Smith, *Getting Out*, 238.
- 256 **The audience was friendly:** Author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019; SCW, letter to WFB, December 13, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 257 **As planned, the direct Q and A:** "The Edgar Smith Story: Part I" and "The Edgar Smith Story: Part II," *Firing Line*, taped December 6, 1971, <https://digitalcollections.hoover.org/objects/6207> and <https://digitalcollections.hoover.org/objects/6208>.
- 257 **Edgar swiveled his chair:** "The Edgar Smith Story: Part II," *Firing Line*, taped December 6, 1971, <https://digitalcollections.hoover.org/objects/6208>.
- 258 **When the taping ended:** Smith, *Getting Out*, 238.
- 258 **His nearest and dearest were there:** SCW, letter to Patricia Buckley, December 9, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 258 **At 2:30 a.m., Edgar borrowed:** Smith, *Getting Out*, 239.
- 259 **The limo dropped Ann off:** Ibid.

26. FREEDOM'S FIRST DAWN

- 261 **No one should have been:** Author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 6, 2019; Associated Press, reprinted in *Press & Sun-Bulletin* (Binghamton, NY), November 7, 1971, 20.
- 261 **She had been a faithful correspondent:** EHS, letter to SCW, May 30, 1971, SWP, Box 25, Folder 6; EHS, letter to WFB, May 31, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 3.

- 262 Late the next morning:** This section is drawn primarily from Hans Knight, “Smith Enjoys First Day of Freedom After 14½ Years on Death Row,” *Bulletin* (Philadelphia), December 7, 1971, WFBP, Box 79, Folder 5.
- 265 Sophie Wilkins waited:** SCW, letter to WFB, December 13, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 265 To judge from the lack:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 18, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 265 Buckley, naturally, didn’t take kindly:** WFB, letter to EHS, March 4, 1971, and EHS, letter to WFB, March 7, 1971, WFBP, Box 154, Folder 2.
- 265 Still, Sophie and Edgar had managed:** Ibid.; WFB, letter to SCW, December 28, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 266 A week after Edgar’s release:** SCW, letter to WFB, December 14, 1971, WFBP, Box 275, Folder 2412.
- 267 The key, she wrote:** Ibid.

27. THE CELEBRITY CONVICT

- 269 John Selser, the lawyer:** *Sunday Press* (Asbury Park, NJ), December 19, 1971, D1.
- 270 Selser reflected on why:** Ibid.
- 270 Steve Umin, whose legal work:** Author’s interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020; SMU, letters to WFB, June 26, 1972, and February 6, 1973, and SMU, telegram to WFB, October 16, 1973, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239.
- 270 Edgar had much to figure out:** EHS, letter to WFB, January 26, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 29, 1971, 1.
- 271 He spent Christmas with his mother:** Author’s interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020; author’s interview with Christopher Buckley, May 4, 2020.
- 271 Two days before the end of 1971:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 29, 1971, 1.
- 271 Edgar said he experienced moments:** Ibid.

- 272 **The day before Lombardi's article:** Author's interview with Aggie Dowd, May 12, 2020.
- 273 **William F. Buckley knew:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, December 14, 1972, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 273 **Edgar had written to Buckley:** EHS, letter to WFB, January 26, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 274 **After that, correspondence:** EHS, postcards to WFB, June 27 and July 4, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 274 **Buckley wrote to Edgar in July:** WFB, letter to EHS, July 18, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 274 **Edgar's Upper West Side apartment:** Author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019; EHS, letter to WFB, January 26, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 275 **Shortly after Edgar's release:** This section is drawn from author's interview with Bill Scheinman, November 16, 2019.

28. COUNTERPOINT

- 277 **Edgar Smith brushed off:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), December 6, 1972, 1, and January 23, 1977, 8. Eileen Conlon did not respond to multiple attempts to reach her.
- 277 **He embraced his literary fame:** For his talk show appearances, see *Ridgewood* [NJ] *Herald-News*, Thursday, January 13, 1972, 50; *Star Tribune* (Minneapolis), March 5, 1972, 223; *Daily News* (New York), April 27, 1972, 110; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, May 25, 1972, 23 and February 3, 1973, 34; and transcript of interview with Arlene Francis, WOR, May 25, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083. For Robert Dilts, see *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), February 2, 1972, 1; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, April 7, 1972, 5; and *New York Times*, March 7, 1972, 39.
- 278 **Ronald Calissi watched:** Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 43–47; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), May 8, 1972, 25.
- 278 **Counterpoint had run so long:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, June 14, 1972, 46.
- 279 **Edgar commented publicly:** Agatha Schmidt, letter to WFB, July 17, 1972, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 28,

- 1973, 20, and February 4, 1973, 120; *Washington Post Book World*, January 21, 1973, 4.
- 279 **Waltz also suggested:** John J. Geoghegan, letter to *Washington Post Book World*, February 4, 1973, 2.
- 279 **William F. Buckley, to whom:** SMU, letter to WFB, February 6, 1973, and WFB, letter to SMU, February 23, 1973, WFBP, Box 260, Folder 2239; WFB, letter to SCW, March 14, 1973, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–3.
- 280 **Edgar found himself back:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), August 30, 1973, C-24; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 30, 1973, 25.
- 280 **During the two-and-a-half-hour hearing:** Ibid.; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, August 31, 1973, 21; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), August 31, 1973, 12.
- 280 **But he returned to court:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), November 14, 1973, 9; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), November 14, 1973, 54; *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, November 14, 1973, 1 and 6.
- 281 **Some months after his release:** Ann Chupak, letter to Frances Bronson, November 30, 1973, Frances Bronson, letter to Ann Chupak, December 3, 1973, Ann Chupak, letter to WFB, June 20, 1974, and WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, June 28, 1974, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497; WFB, letter to EHS, February 20, 1974, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.

29. PAIGE

- 283 **Paige Hiemier resembled:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 11, 1988, 3; *Los Angeles Times*, July 5, 1989; EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 283 **Paige was a prodigy:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), September 6, 1972, 2.
- 284 **She was shy and introverted:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), June 3, 1969, 13.
- 284 **She met Edgar:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 11, 1988; EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 284 **She claimed she had never talked:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 11, 1988, 3.
- 284 **Her choice of boyfriend:** Ibid.; EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 285 **Just before Paige left:** Author's interview with Ron Calissi, January 9, 2015; author's interview with Paige Hiemier, March 4, 2018.

- 285 Paige and Edgar moved:** Edgar H. Smith and Paige Hiemier, marriage record, December 31, 1974, California marriage index, 1960–1985, on Ancestry.com; *Daily News* (New York), February 4, 1975, JL5.
- 286 Ann Chupak had written:** Ann Chupak, letter to WFB, June 20, 1974, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 286 Buckley wrote her back:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, June 28, 1974, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 286 Eileen had continued:** Ann Chupak, letter to WFB, June 20, 1974, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 287 Buckley knew the score:** WFB, letters to Ann Chupak, November 25, 1974, and January 30, 1975, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 287 Buckley finally heard from Edgar:** EHS, telegram to WFB, December 19, 1974, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 287 Buckley supposed that Edgar's:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, January 30, 1975, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 288 Edgar wrote again in February:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 288 Edgar, in his telling:** Ibid.
- 288 From then on, Edgar:** EHS, letter to WFB, February 28, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 289 Buckley took some time:** WFB, letter to EHS, February 18, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 289 After that exchange:** For more on Buckley's advocacy of Gary McGivern and Charles Culhane, described in detail in the footnote, see *Daily Freeman* (Kingston, NY), March 14, 1975, 1 and 11, March 16, 1975, 1, and March 27, 1975, 11; William F. Buckley, Jr., "A Sentence Bent by Politics," *On the Right*, January 22, 1986; and Gary McGivern and Marguerite Culp Papers 1967–2003, Lloyd Sealy Library, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, New York.
- 290 Buckley flew to California:** EHS, letter to WFB, March 4, 1975, and WFB, letter to EHS, March 26, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 290 When Paige went:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Protracted Life of Edgar Smith," *Life*, February 1979, 54–70.
- 290 At the end of the night:** WFB, letter to EHS, March 26, 1975, and EHS, letter to WFB, February 5, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.

- 291 **Paige wrote to Buckley:** Paige Hiemier, letter to WFB, April 1975, and WFB, letter to Paige Hiemier, April 16, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 291 **After their reunion:** EHS, letters to WFB, March 30, May 18, June 9, 17, and 30, July 8 and 24, and September 2 and 17, 1975, and WFB, letters to EHS, April 22, April 29, May 9, June 17, July 15, August 6, and October 1, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 292 **Soon Edgar wasn't working:** EHS, letters to WFB, September 17 and October 6, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 292 **Edgar described Paige's health issues:** Ibid.; WFB, letter to EHS, November 3, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 292 **The truth, which Paige revealed:** William M. Schmidt, Office of the Bergen County Prosecutor, "Objection to the Parole of Edgar Smith," July 31, 2000; *Los Angeles Times*, July 5, 1989, 17.
- 293 **He did receive a litany:** EHS, letter to WFB, March 30, 1975, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 293 **The last straws came:** Testimony of Gerald Warren, *The People of the State of California v. Edgar Herbert Smith, Jr.*, Superior Court of California, County of San Diego, Docket no. A17321, 387–400.

30. RAGE, REVIVED

- 298 **Lefteriya Ozbun finished her shift:** This section is drawn primarily from *The People of the State of California v. Edgar Herbert Smith, Jr.*, Superior Court of California, County of San Diego, Docket no. A17321. Ozbun's testimony begins on page 30 of the court transcript prepared as part of EHS's appeal of his conviction to the Fourth Appellate District, Court of Appeal for the State of California.
- 299 **Before Lisa could react:** Testimony of Lefteriya Ozbun, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 46–47.
- 299 **Lisa knew with utter clarity:** *Los Angeles Times*, July 5, 1989, San Diego County section, 2.
- 299 **She started to struggle:** Testimony of Lefteriya Ozbun, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 48–52.
- 300 **Lisa managed to get:** Ibid., 53.
- 300 **People rushed toward her:** Ibid., 54–58.

- 300 **Then the driver snapped out:** Testimony of Frank Hobdy, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 120–32; testimony of Darwin Ozbun, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 80–84.
- 300 **The ambulance ferried Lisa:** Testimony of Morton C. Jorgensen, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 107–19.
- 301 **Lisa was in intensive care:** *Daily News* (New York), October 8, 1976, 3; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), November 14, 1976, A-16.
- 301 **When the police ran:** Testimony of Johnny Boulden, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 174–90.

31. ON THE RUN

- 303 **Betty Lovell's telephone rang:** Testimony of Betty Lovell, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 256–70.
- 304 **Sandler had known Edgar:** Testimony of Herbert Sandler, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 166–74.
- 305 **Shortly after midnight:** Testimony of Barbara Fenity, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 144–60.
- 305 **While Barbara was at work:** Testimony of Stephen Jordan, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 160–66.
- 306 **Edgar picked up Barbara:** Testimony of Barbara Fenity, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 144–60.
- 306 **William F. Buckley heard:** Author's interview with Christopher Buckley, May 4, 2020; author's interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020; WFB, letter to SMU, 260, Folder 2239.
- 306 **Buckley also called:** Author's interview with Christopher Buckley, May 4, 2020.
- 307 **Meanwhile, Edgar actually was:** Police investigative notes, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, October 13, 1976; author's interview with Geoffrey Norman, March 16, 2021.
- 308 **By that time:** Ibid.
- 308 **Edgar called Barbara Fenity:** Testimony of Barbara Fenity, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 144–60.
- 308 **At some point:** Testimony of Edgar Smith, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 432–42.

- 309 **The phone at the *National Review* offices:** William F. Buckley, Jr., “The Return of Edgar Smith,” *On the Right*, November 20, 1976.

32. ARRESTED AGAIN

- 311 **Five FBI agents arrived:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), October 14, 1976, A-1 and A-5; testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 432–42.
- 312 **Edgar was arraigned:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), October 14, 1976, A-1, and October 17, 1976, A-4.
- 312 **After a preliminary hearing:** Abbreviated court minutes, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, November 16, 1976; *Daily News* (New York), November 17, 1976, JL 5.
- 312 **Once that news became public:** WFB, letter to Ann Chupak, November 29, 1976, WFBP, Box 114, Folder 497.
- 313 **The judge finally decided:** Abbreviated court minutes, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, November 19, 1976; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, November 20, 1976, 1.
- 313 **At the bail hearing:** *Ibid.*
- 313 **The point was moot:** William F. Buckley, Jr., “The Return of Edgar Smith,” *On the Right*, November 20, 1976.
- 313 **Paige was determined:** Paige Smith, letter to WFB, October 28, 1976, and WFB, letter to Paige Smith, November 8, 1976, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 314 **When her family told her:** Jack Carley, letter to WFB, November 29, 1976, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 314 **Paige telephoned Jack Carley:** *Ibid.*; Paige Smith, letter to Jack Carley, November 24, 1976, WFBP, Box 244, Folder 2083.
- 314 **Paige paid a high price:** *State of California v. Paige Dana Smith*, Docket no. A19239; *Paterson [NJ] Evening News*, January 29, 1977, 3; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 30, 1977, 3.
- 314 **Paige surrendered:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), January 30, 1977, 3, and July 13, 1977, 3; *State of California v. Paige Dana Smith*, Docket no. A19239.
- 315 **Her supervisor, Sherry Ryan:** Letter from Sherry Ryan, *State of California v. Paige Dana Smith*, Docket no. A19239.

- 315 **Paige's criminal conviction:** Order dismissing accusation against probationer, July 28, 1982, *State of California v. Paige Dana Smith*, Docket no. A19239.

33. "THE SAGA OF A BAD MAN"

- 317 **Edgar Smith's trial began:** *The People of the State of California v. Edgar Herbert Smith, Jr.*, Superior Court of California, County of San Diego, Docket no. A17321.
- 317 **In unflinching detail, she described:** Testimony of Leteriya Ozbun, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 30–80.
- 317 **Neely called several more witnesses:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, testimony of Barbara Fenity, 144–60; testimony of Herbert Sandler, 166–74; testimony of Betty Lovell, 265–70; additional witness testimony, 174–256.
- 317 **Ryan called a handful:** Testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 276–320.
- 318 **His testimony proved to be astonishing:** *Ibid.*; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 29, 1977, A-1 and A-5.
- 318 **He said his life:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 29, 1977, A-1 and A-5.
- 319 **On cross-examination:** Testimony of Edgar H. Smith, *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 321–87.
- 319 **The lawyers made their closing arguments:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 410.
- 319 **The next morning:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 31, 1977, 1; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 31, 1977, 1; *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 411–17.
- 320 **Judge Harelson asked:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 411–17.
- 320 **On March 31, Edgar didn't arrive:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 418–20.
- 320 **Judge Harelson found Edgar:** *Ibid.*, 423; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 1, 1977, 1.
- 321 **The court finally reconvened:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 452–77.
- 321 **Then Edgar tried another tack:** *Ibid.*; *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), April 26, 1977, 1.

- 322 **He carried on:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 452–77; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 26, 1977, 1.
- 323 **Judge Harelson clearly agreed:** *State of California v. Edgar H. Smith, Jr.*, 473–77.
- 323 **In Bergen County, some people celebrated:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 26, 1977, 1.
- 323 **The original prosecutor, Guy Calissi:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), March 30, 1977, 1.
- 323 **Guy's son Ron:** *Ridgewood* [NJ] *Herald-News*, March 31, 1977, 6.
- 324 **Edward Fitzpatrick, the prosecutor:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), April 3, 1977, 27.
- 324 **The Paterson Evening News tracked down:** *Paterson* [NJ] *Evening News*, March 31, 1977, 23; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 30, 1977, 1.
- 324 **The Bergen Record's April 4 editorial:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 4, 1977, 40.

34. "USED AND BETRAYED"

- 325 **William F. Buckley had wanted:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Return of Edgar Smith," *On the Right*, November 20, 1976; author's interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020.
- 325 **Buckley did not buy:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Saga of Edgar Smith, Part III," *On the Right*, April 19, 1977.
- 326 **The next month, Buckley:** *Herald-News* (Passaic, NJ), May 4, 1977, 13.
- 326 **For once, Buckley:** *Ibid.*
- 326 **He faced more pointed criticism:** Associated Press, reprinted in *Daily American* (Somerset County, PA), August 29, 1977, 9.
- 326 **Buckley would be more eloquent:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "The Protracted Life of Edgar Smith," *Life*, February 1979, 54–70.
- 327 **But it had become plain:** *Ibid.*
- 327 **Edgar learned of the Life article:** EHS, letter to WFB, January 28, 1979, SWP, Box 6, Folder 4.
- 327 **He sent his soon-to-be ex-wife:** EHS, letter to Paige Smith, February 1, 1979, SWP, Box 6, Folder 4.

- 328 **He was particularly incensed:** EHS, letter to WFB, January 28, 1979, SWP, Box 6, Folder 4.
- 328 **And he wasn't done:** Ibid.
- 328 **Bill responded on February 23:** WFB, letter to EHS, February 23, 1979, WFBP, Box 78, Folder 1-2.
- 329 **Edgar sent Paige a copy:** Paige Smith, letter to WFB, February 16, 1979, WFBP, Box 78, Folder 1-2.
- 329 **Buckley responded to Paige's letter:** WFB, letter to Paige Smith, March 1, 1979, Box 78, Folder 1-2.
- 330 **Nearly a year after the attack:** *Lefteriya Lisa Ozbun and Darwin Ozbun v. Edgar Herbert Smith, and Does 1 Through 150, Inclusive*, Superior Court of the State of California, County of San Diego, Docket no. 405162, complaint filed September 30, 1977.
- 330 **Edgar and the Ozbuns' lawyer:** EHS, motion to dismiss the Ozbuns' lawsuit, November 10, 1980; document scheduling a trial for August 16, 1982.
- 330 **But Ozbun kept fighting:** *Los Angeles Times*, July 5, 1989, San Diego County section, 2.
- 331 **She felt grateful to be alive:** Ibid.

35. A STRANGE TRIANGLE

- 335 **As far as William F. Buckley was concerned:** Author's interview with Jack Carley, May 13, 2020; author's interview with Christopher Buckley, May 4, 2020.
- 335 **His son, Christopher, provided some insight:** *Boston Globe*, May 23, 1982, A-13.
- 336 **Sophie became Buckley's de facto first reader:** William F. Buckley, Jr., "Sophie Wilkins, R.I.P.," *National Review*, June 2, 2003, 14; WFB, letter to SCW, March 14, 1973, SWP, Box 6, Folder 3.
- 337 **The 1979 publication:** SCW, letter to WFB, August 1979, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1-3.
- 337 **Buckley and Sophie also commiserated:** WFB, letter to SCW, July 11, 1981, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1-3.
- 337 **Then, out of the blue:** EHS, letter to WFB, June 3, 1998, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1-3; Edgar Smith, *A Tale of Old San Francisco: A Historical*

Account of the Tragic Life of William B. Sheppard, Born in Ireland 1827, Hanged in San Francisco 1854 (Reno, NV: Sejanus Press, 1998), introduction.

- 337 **Edgar's literary agent, Bob Lescher:** Robert Lescher, letter to WFB, July 15, 1980, WFBP, Box 78, Folders 1–2.
- 338 **Buckley sent a copy:** WFB, memorandum to Sophie Wilkins, Steve Umin, and Jack Carley, June 24, 1998, WFB, letter to SCW, June 24, 1998, and SCW, letter to WFB, July 4, 1998, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–2.
- 338 **After Edgar received:** EHS, letter to WFB, June 3, 1998, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–2.
- 339 **He wrote that he felt some urgency:** Ibid.
- 339 **In May 2003:** Buckley, “Sophie Wilkins, R.I.P.”
- 340 **Sophie had been far happier:** Author's interview with Adam Wilkins, December 21, 2018; correspondence between SCW and WFB, 1983–2003, SWP, Boxes 6–8.
- 340 **In the fall of 2002:** Buckley, “Sophie Wilkins, R.I.P.”
- 340 **They were a strange triangle:** SCW, letter to WFB, July 4, 1998, SWP, Box 7, Folders 1–2.

36. VACAVILLE

- 341 **Edgar Smith thought:** EHS, letter to Henry Goldman, July 1977, reprinted in *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 2, 1978, C-11; *Edgar H. Smith v. Edwin Miller et al.* (1989), Civil no. 90–0225-E-BTM, United States District Court for the Southern District of California, summary judgment granted September 5, 1992; Mike Kelly, letter to Ronald Calissi, December 7, 1989, Ronald A. Calissi personal papers.
- 341 **But the last forty years:** Psychiatric evaluation reports included with California Bureau of Prisons Parole Board documents, 1986, 1988, 1992, 1994, 1999, and 2000, obtained by the author, 2014.
- 342 **Interviews with the press:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), February 19, 1978, 1; Edward H. Smith, Jr., “Edgar Smith Looks Back,” *Record* (Bergen, NJ), March 2, 1978, C-11; February 24, 1982, marriage record to Beverly Bevan, listed in the California Marriage Index, 1960–1982, on Ancestry.com; reference to Travel Plus in the transcript for EHS's 1987

- parole hearing; Beverley Bevan, death notice, listed in the Social Security Death Index, 1936–2007, on Ancestry.com.
- 342 **“I don’t think Edgar”:** *Los Angeles Times*, July 5, 1989, R-17.
- 342 **Paige sought to rebuild her life:** Paige Hiemier, letters to the State of California Board of Parole Hearings, 1988 and undated (likely early 1990s); conversation and email correspondence with the author, 2018; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), July 11, 1988, 3.
- 342 **She could not outrun:** William M. Schmidt, Office of the Bergen County Prosecutor, “Objection to the Parole of Edgar Smith,” July 31, 2000; *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 6, 2009, L-1.
- 343 **When Edgar was up for parole:** *Record* (Bergen, NJ), April 6, 2009, L-1.
- 343 **Patricia Horton had tried:** Author’s interviews with “Patti Hafford” and “Jennifer Hafford,” September 10 and 21, 2019.
- 343 **But Patti wasn’t interested:** Author’s interview with “Patti Hafford,” September 10, 2019.
- 344 **The Haffords, along with Patti:** Patricia and Gene Hafford, divorce record, March 25, 1981, King County, Washington; author’s interview with “Patti Hafford,” September 10, 2019.
- 344 **Patti had few complaints:** Author’s interviews with “Patti Hafford” and “Jennifer Hafford,” September 10 and 21, 2019; “Patricia Hafford,” death record, June 6, 2009, Social Security Death Index, on Ancestry.com.
- 345 **Jennifer, by then in her thirties:** Interviews with “Jennifer Hafford,” by the author, September 21, 2019, and by Rosemarie Ho, April 6, 2021.
- 347 **Edgar Smith’s final parole hearing:** State of California Board of Parole Hearings, High Desert State Prison, Susanville, California, April 23, 2009.
- 347 **He’d waived his parole hearings:** State of California Board of Parole Hearings, stipulations in 2007 and 2008.
- 347 **He argued:** State of California Board of Parole Hearings, High Desert State Prison, Susanville, California, April 23, 2009.
- 348 **In his final parole hearing:** Ibid.; author, letter to EHS, December 10, 2014, and EHS, reply to the author, December 19, 2014.
- 349 **Stiebel, who died in 2002:** Steve Behrens, “The Liberal Behind Buck-

ley's Talk Show, Warren Steibel, Dies at 76," *Current*, February 11, 2002, Internet Archives Wayback Machine, <https://web.archive.org/web/20120204091616/http://www.current.org/people/peop0203steibel.html>; Craig Unger and Sharon Churcher, "Film Deal for Fast-Talking Slayer," *New York*, May 11, 1981, 13.

- 349 **Edgar closed with a question:** EHS, letter to the author, December 19, 2014.
- 349 **I took his final question first:** Author, letter to EHS, January 1, 2015.
- 350 **Edgar's next letter:** EHS, letter to the author, February 10, 2015.
- 350 **Instead, I sent a list:** Author, letter to EHS, March 9, 2015.
- 350 **The tone was blistering:** EHS, letter to the author, April 6, 2015.
- 351 **Edgar Smith died:** Paul W. Valentine, "Edgar H. Smith, Death Row Inmate Whose Release Was Championed by William F. Buckley Jr., Dies at 83," *Washington Post*, September 23, 2017; author's interview with "Patti Hafford," September 10, 2019.
- 351 **Edgar's death went unnoticed:** David Stout, "Edgar Smith, Killer Who Duped William F. Buckley, Dies at 83," *New York Times*, September 25, 2017.
- 351 **Edgar had outlived so many:** Aside from previously sourced obituaries: Paul Vitello, "Robert Lescher, Editor and Literary Agent, Dies at 83," *New York Times*, December 8, 2012; Steven M. Umin, obituary, *Washington Post*, February 19, 2012; Jay Levin, "Ronald Calissi, Bergen County Public-Safety School Head and 'Larger than Life' Figure, Dies at 69," *Record* (Bergen, NJ), September 26, 2016; Deborah Fredericks, email to the author, May 11, 2017.
- 351 **Paige Hiemier had been reluctant:** Paige Hiemier, email to the author, May 11, 2017; author's conversation with Paige Hiemier, March 4, 2018.
- 352 **Patti, Edgar's daughter:** Author's interviews with "Patti Hafford" and "Jennifer Hafford," September 10 and 21, 2019.

CODA: 1948

- 353 **Kathy Bell began the walk home:** This section is drawn largely from a police report written up by the New Milford, New Jersey, police department, case no. I-555, December 6, 1948, WFBP, Box 276, Folder

9; Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, NJ: Manor, 1972), 1009–17; and Kathy Bell’s interview with the Bergen County Prosecutor’s Office, included as part of William M. Schmidt, Office of the Bergen County Prosecutor, “Objection to the Parole of Edgar Smith,” July 31, 2000.

- 356 **Edgar Smith told:** Edgar Smith, *Brief Against Death* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1968), 48–49; William F. Buckley, Jr., “The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.,” *Esquire*, November 1965, 116–21, 178–83.
- 356 **Outraged, Kathy told:** Calissi, *Counterpoint*, 1009–17.
- 357 **Nearly three decades later:** William M. Schmidt, Office of the Bergen County Prosecutor, “Objection to the Parole of Edgar Smith,” July 31, 2000.
- 358 **Kathy Bell died in 2008:** Kathy Bell, obituary and Social Security record. Her married last name is being withheld to protect the family’s privacy.

Bibliography

SELECTED WORKS BY EDGAR H. SMITH, JR.

Brief Against Death (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1968)

A Reasonable Doubt (New York: Coward-McCann, 1970)

71 Hours (written as Michael Mason; New York: Coward, McCann & Geoghegan, 1972)

Getting Out (New York: Coward, McCann & Geoghegan, 1973)

A Tale of Old San Francisco (Reno, NV: Sejanus Press, 1998)

SELECTED WORKS BY WILLIAM F. BUCKLEY, JR.

God and Man at Yale (Chicago: Henry Regnery Company, 1951)

McCarthy and His Enemies: The Record and Its Meaning (with L. Brent Bozell, Jr.; Chicago: Henry Regnery Company, 1954)

Up From Liberalism (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1959)

"The Approaching End of Edgar H. Smith, Jr.," *Esquire*, November 1, 1965

The Unmaking of a Mayor (New York: Viking Press, 1966)

Cruising Speed: A Documentary (New York: Putnam, 1971)

Saving the Queen: A Novel (New York: Doubleday, 1976)

Stained Glass: A Novel (New York: Doubleday, 1978)

"The Protracted Life of Edgar Smith," *Life*, February 1979.

Overdrive: A Personal Documentary (New York: Doubleday, 1983)

Miles Gone By: A Literary Autobiography (Chicago: Regnery Publishing, 2004)

WORKS BY OTHERS ON BUCKLEY

- Carl T. Bogus, *Buckley: William F. Buckley Jr. and the Rise of American Conservatism* (London: Bloomsbury Press, 2011)
- Richard Brookhiser, *Right Time, Right Place: Coming of Age with William F. Buckley Jr. and the Conservative Movement* (New York: Basic Books, 2009)
- Nicholas Buccola, *The Fire Is Upon Us: James Baldwin, William F. Buckley Jr., and the Debate over Race in America* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2019)
- Carol Buckley, *At the Still Point: A Memoir* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1996)
- Christopher Buckley, *Losing Mum and Pup: A Memoir* (New York: Twelve Books, 2009)
- Priscilla L. Buckley, *Living It Up with National Review: A Memoir* (Dallas, TX: Spence Publishing Company, 2005)
- Lee Edwards, *William F. Buckley, Jr.: The Maker of a Movement* (Wilmington, DE: Intercollegiate Studies Institute, 2010)
- Alvin S. Felzenberg, *A Man and His Presidents: The Political Odyssey of William F. Buckley, Jr.* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2017)
- John B. Judis, *William F. Buckley, Jr.: Patron Saint of the Conservatives* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1988).
- Charles Lam Markmann, *The Buckleys: A Family Examined* (New York: William Morrow & Company, 1973)
- William F. Meehan III (ed.), *Conversations with William F. Buckley, Jr.* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2009)
- Kevin M. Schultz, *Buckley and Mailer: The Difficult Friendship That Shaped the Sixties* (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2015)

OTHER WORKS

- Ronald E. Calissi, *Counterpoint: The Edgar Smith Case* (Hackensack, New Jersey: Manor Book Company, 1972)
- Harry Camisa and Jim Franklin, *Inside Out: Fifty Years Behind the Walls of New Jersey's Trenton State Prison* (Windsor, NJ: Windsor Press & Publishing, 2003)
- Jerome B. Falk, Jr., "Review: *Brief Against Death*," *California Law Review* 57, no. 3 (May 1969): 830–35
- Brian Garfield (ed.), *I, Witness: Personal Encounters with Crime by Members of the Mystery Writers of America* (New York: Times Books, 1978)
- Theodore Hamm, *Rebel and a Cause: Caryl Chessman and the Politics of the Death Penalty in Postwar California, 1948–1979* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001)
- Lona Manning, "The Great Prevaricator," *Crime Magazine*, 2003 (last updated October 10, 2009, accessed at <http://www.crimemagazine.com/great-prevaricator-0>)
- David Quammen, *To Walk the Line: A Novel* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1970)
- Gary Rosenshield, "Crime and Redemption, Russian and American Style: Dostoevsky, Buckley, Mailer, Styron, and Their Wards," *The Slavic and East European Journal* 42, no. 4 (Winter 1998): 677–709