

AFTER JESUS — BEFORE — CHRISTIANITY

A HISTORICAL EXPLORATION OF THE
FIRST TWO CENTURIES OF JESUS MOVEMENTS

ERIN K. VEARNCOMBE, BERNARD BRANDON SCOTT,
HAL TAUSSIG, for the WESTAR CHRISTIANITY SEMINAR



HarperOne

An Imprint of HarperCollins Publishers

AFTER JESUS BEFORE CHRISTIANITY. Copyright © 2021 by Westar Institute. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews. For information, address HarperCollins Publishers, 195 Broadway, New York, NY 10007.

HarperCollins books may be purchased for educational, business, or sales promotional use. For information, please email the Special Markets Department at SPsales@harpercollins.com.

FIRST EDITION

Designed by Bonni Leon-Berman

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available upon request.

ISBN 978-0-06-306215-3

21 22 23 24 25 LSC 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS BOOK AND SUPPORTING MEMBERS OF WESTAR'S CHRISTIANITY SEMINAR

For a more complete list of Westar fellows and seminar members, please visit www.westarinstitute.org. Every person that spoke up throughout the life of the seminar deserves acknowledgment and celebration. Westar thanks everyone at the seminar's table; in challenge and in affirmation, the voices present helped to newly hear voices past.

Al-Suadi Soham

Professor of New Testament

University of Rostock

Susan M. (Elli) Elliott, PhD

*Think Tank Analyst and
Coordinator*

Westar Institute

Jason David BeDuhn

*Professor, Comparative Study of
Religions*

Northern Arizona University

David Galston, PhD

Executive Director

Westar Institute

Arthur J. Dewey, ThD

Professor of Theology

Xavier University

Glenna S. Jackson, PhD

*Professor, Department of Religion
and Philosophy*

Otterbein University

Joanna Dewey, PhD

*Harvey H. Guthrie Jr., Professor
Emerita*

Episcopal Divinity School

Perry V. Kea, PhD

Associate Professor Emeritus

University of Indianapolis

CONTRIBUTORS

Celene Lillie

Lecturer

University of Colorado, Boulder

Nina E. Livesey, PhD

Professor of Religious Studies

University of Oklahoma

Lane C. McGaughy, PhD

*George H. Atkinson Professor
of Religious and Ethical Studies
Emeritus*

Willamette University

Robert J. Miller, PhD

*Rosenberger Professor of Christian
Thought and Religious Studies*

Juniata College

Stephen J. Patterson

*George H. Atkinson Professor of
Religious Studies*

Willamette University

Shirley Paulson, PhD

Founder, Early Christian Texts

EarlyChristianTexts.com

Deborath Niederer Saxton, PhD

Affiliate Faculty

Christian Theological Seminary

Bernard Brandon Scott, PhD

*Darbeth Distinguished Professor
of New Testament Emeritus*

Phillips Theological Seminary

Christine Shea, PhD

Professor of Classics

Ball State University

Thandeka, PhD

President

Love Beyond Belief, Inc.

Hal Taussig, PhD

*Professor of New Testament,
Retired*

Union Theological Seminary

Erin K. Vearncombe, PhD

Assistant Professor

University of Toronto

Chad Venters, PhD

*Instructor of Humanities and
Philosophy*

Truckee Meadows Community
College

David Wheeler-Reed, PhD

Independent Scholar

NOTES

Chapter 2: If Not Christian, What?

1. Unless otherwise indicated, translations of ancient texts are those of: Erin K. Vearncombe, Hal Taussig, and Bernard Brandon Scott. Because there is no canon of the New Testament in the first two centuries of the Common Era, we have treated canonical and noncanonical books the same typographically, meaning that none of these books are italicized. They should be treated the same, so they should look the same in our text.
2. Pliny the Younger, *Letters, Volume II: Books 8–10. Panegyricus*, trans. Betty Radice, Loeb Classical Library 59 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1969).
3. Tacitus, *Annals: Books 13–16*, trans. John Jackson, Loeb Classical Library 322 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1937), XV.44.
4. Cicero, *In Catilinam 1–4. Pro Murena. Pro Sulla. Pro Flacco*, trans. C. MacDonald, Loeb Classical Library 324 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1976).
5. See Dennis E. Smith and Joseph B. Tyson, eds., *Acts and Christian Beginnings: The Acts Seminar Report* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2013).

Chapter 3: Engine of Empire: Violence

1. Celene Lillie, *The Rape of Eve: The Transformation of Roman Ideology in Three Early Christian Retellings of Genesis* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2017).
2. The historian Josephus recounts that ninety-seven thousand people were taken prisoner—read, enslaved—at the conclusion of the siege of Jerusalem in 70 CE (*The Jewish War* 6.9.3). For more on enslavement in the Roman world and in early Christian contexts, see Jennifer A. Glancy, *Slavery in Early Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2002).
3. Inscription is published as CIL II 3258. The tombstone dates to the second century. Currently the stone is part of Madrid's National Archaeological Museum collection.
4. Translation from the New Jerusalem Bible.
5. Translation from *A New New Testament*.
6. Translation from the New Jerusalem Bible.
7. Translations from Robert J. Miller, ed., *The Complete Gospels: The Scholars Version*, 4th ed. (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).

NOTES

8. See, for example, Maia Kotrosits and Hal Taussig, *Re-reading the Gospel of Mark Amidst Loss and Trauma* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013).

Chapter 4: Gospel of Empire, Gospel of Jesus

1. Translation from Frederick W. Danker, *Benefactor: Epigraphic Study of a Graeco-Roman and New Testament Semantic Field* (St. Louis: Clayton Publishing House, 1982), 216–217.
2. For a thorough examination of the Gemma Augustea, see Susan M. (Elli) Elliott, *Family Empires, Roman and Christian. Vol. I: Roman Family Empires: Household, Empire, Resistance* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2018), preface.
3. Translation lightly adapted from Arthur J. Dewey, Roy W. Hoover, Lane C. McGaughy, and Daryl D. Schmidt, trans., *The Authentic Letters of Paul: A New Reading of Paul's Rhetoric and Meaning, the Scholars Version* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).
4. Translations from Robert J. Miller, ed., *The Complete Gospels: The Scholars Version*, 4th ed. (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).

Chapter 5: Violence in Stone

1. Dio Cassius, *Roman History, Vol. VIII: Books 61–70*, trans. Earnest Cary and Herbert B. Foster, Loeb Classical Library 176 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1925), LXVI.26. On Titus's death, see also Suetonius, *Lives of the Caesars, Volume II*, trans. J. C. Rolfe, Loeb Classical Library 38 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1914), *Deified Titus* 10.
2. Dio Cassius, *Roman History* LXVI.26.
3. This is according to the Westar Institute's Acts Seminar: Dennis E. Smith and Joseph B. Tyson, eds., *Acts and Christian Beginnings: The Acts Seminar Report* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2013).
4. Josephus, *Jewish War, Vol. III: Books 5–7*, trans. H. St. J. Thackeray, Loeb Classical Library 201 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1928), V.449–451. Further quotations from *Jewish War* are from this edition.
5. This tradition is preserved in the writing of the second-century Carthaginian Tertullian, *Apology* 33.
6. Amanda Claridge, *Rome: An Oxford Archaeological Guide* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1998), 278.
7. See Meet the Romans with Mary Beard, "All Roads Lead to Rome" (episode 1), BBC Two, <https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b01ghsjx>.
8. Tacitus, *Agricola. Germania. Dialogue on Oratory*, trans. M. Hutton and W. Peterson, Loeb Classical Library 35 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1914).

NOTES

Chapter 6: The Deaths of Heroes

1. Plato, *Phaedo*, in *The Last Days of Socrates: Euthyphro, the Apology, Crito, Phaedo*, trans. Hugh Tredennick (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969). Further quotations from *Phaedo* are from this edition.
2. Quotations from Lucretia's story are from Livy, *History of Rome, Vol. I: Books 1–2*, trans. B. O. Foster, Loeb Classical Library 114 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1919), I.i.57–58.
3. Translations of 2 Maccabees are from the New Revised Standard Version.
4. Translations of 4 Maccabees are from H. Anderson, "4 Maccabees: A New Translation and Introduction," in James H. Charlesworth, ed., *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha. Vol. 2: Expansions of the "Old Testament" and Legends, Wisdom and Philosophical Literature, Prayers, Psalms, and Odes, Fragments for Lost Judeo-Hellenistic Works*, Anchor Bible Reference Library (New York: Doubleday, 1985).
5. Translations of 1 Corinthians are from, or lightly adapted from, Arthur J. Dewey, Roy W. Hoover, Lane C. McGaughy, and Daryl D. Schmidt, trans., *The Authentic Letters of Paul: A New Reading of Paul's Rhetoric and Meaning, the Scholars Version* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).
6. Gospel translations in Chapter 6 are from Robert J. Miller, ed., *The Complete Gospels: The Scholars Version*, 4th ed. (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).

Chapter 7: Testing Gender, Testing Boundaries

1. Translations of Gospel of Mary are from Celene Lillie, "The Gospel of Mary," in *A New New Testament: A Bible for the Twenty-First Century Combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts*, ed. Hal Taussig, 224–226 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013), with some emendations. Lillie's 2018 paper for the Seminar, "Thinking Through Gender in the Second Century Jesus Movements," was essential to the writing of this chapter.
2. Celene Lillie, "Thinking Through Gender."
3. This translation of 1 Timothy is from the New Revised Standard Version.

Chapter 8: Forming New Identities Through Gender

1. Aristotle, *Generation of Animals*, trans. A. L. Peck, Loeb Classical Library 366 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1042), II 737a.
2. Galen, *On the Usefulness of the Parts of the Body* 14.6, trans. Margaret Tallmadge May, referenced in Elaine Fantham, Helene Peet Foley, Natalie Boymel Kampen, Sarah B. Pomeroy, and H. A. Shapiro,

NOTES

- Women in the Classical World: Image and Text* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1994), 201.
3. Trans. Heinrich von Staden, referenced in Fantham et al., *Women in the Classical World*, 194.
 4. Virginia Burrus, “The Gender of Martyrdom,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, Denver, November 2018.
 5. Translations of 4 Maccabees in this chapter are from the New Revised Standard Version, with adaptations by the authors shown in square brackets. The NRSV sometimes uses terms we find inappropriate for ancient contexts, such as the word “Judaism” in this particular quotation. “Judaism” as such was not a fixed “entity” or institution in this time period. While the NRSV reads “Judaism,” we believe “ancestral practice” would be a more appropriate translation for the context.
 6. Burrus, “Gender of Martyrdom.”
 7. Translation from Burrus, “Gender of Martyrdom.”
 8. This line is adapted from Herbert Musurillo, *The Acts of the Christian Martyrs* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1972). Musurillo’s text presents Blandina as saying “I am a Christian,” but we know from our work in Chapter 2 that this translation is not accurate.

Chapter 9: Belonging to Israel

1. Translation is that of the authors. Another (though similar) translation by Philip A. Harland and the original Greek text, as well as images of the tomb, are available at Associations in the Greco-Roman World, “[152] Grave of Glykon with Bequest to Purple-Dyers and Carpet-Weavers (161–250 CE); Hierapolis–Phrygia,” <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/152-grave-of-glykon-involving-purple-dyers-and-carpet-weavers/>. Highly recommended reading is Philip A. Harland, *Dynamics of Identity in the World of the Early Christians: Associations, Judeans, and Cultural Minorities* (New York: T&T Clark International/Continuum Press, 2009). See also Philip Harland, “Acculturation and Identity in the Diaspora: A Jewish Family and ‘Pagan’ Guilds at Hierapolis,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 57, no. 2 (2006): 222–244, <https://doi.org/10.18647/2670/JJS-2006>.
2. This idea of an “ethnic ladder” comes from Philip A. Harland, “Climbing the Ethnic Ladder: A Portrait of Interactions Between Judeans and Other Peoples,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, San Antonio, November 2016.
3. Again, for more on this idea of ethnic hierarchy, see Harland, “Climbing the Ethnic Ladder.”

NOTES

4. In her book *Rethinking Early Christian Identity: Affect, Violence, and Belonging* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015), Maia Kotrosits considers the language of diaspora, specifically Israelite diaspora and experiences of trauma in and through diaspora, to help us to work through these questions about belonging. The Seminar takes a different direction on those questions in this book.
5. See Caroline Johnson Hodge, *If Sons, Then Heirs: A Study of Kinship and Ethnicity in the Letters of Paul* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2007).
6. Burton L. Mack, *Who Wrote the New Testament? The Making of the Christian Myth* (San Francisco: HarperOne, 1996), 30–31.
7. Daniel Boyarin, “The Christian Invention of ‘Judaism,’” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, San Antonio, November 2016. See also these responses to Boyarin’s work: Maia Kotrosits, “Devising Collectives: Losing the Nation in the Story of Judaism and Christianity: A Response to Daniel Boyarin’s *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism* and *A Traveling Homeland: The Babylonia Talmud as Diaspora*,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, San Antonio, November 2016; and Nina Livesey, “Difference and Similarity: A Review of Daniel Boyarin’s *A Radical Jew: Paul and the Politics of Identity and Border Lines: The Partition of Judaeo-Christianity*,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, San Antonio, November 2016.

Chapter 10: Experimental Families

1. Translation of Acts of Paul and Thecla from J. K. Elliott, “The Acts of Paul and Thecla,” in *The Apocryphal New Testament*, ed. J. K. Elliott (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993), 366.
2. Translation lightly adapted from Aristotle, *Politics*, trans. H. Rackham, Loeb Classical Library 264 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1932).
3. Susan M. (Elli) Elliott, *Family Empires, Roman and Christian. Vol. I: Roman Family Empires: Household, Empire, Resistance* (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2018), ch. 3 (n.p.).
4. P.Oxy. 7 1021, from Oxyrhynchus, Egypt, dated November 17, 54 CE. Notification of accession of Nero. Greek text available at Papyri.info, <http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.oxy;7;1021>.
5. The term “household lens” comes from Lillian I. Larsen, “Re-defining ‘Solitude’: Monastic Registers of Fictive (and Factual) Family,” *Forum* 9, no. 1 (2020): 77–102, here 90.
6. See Elliott, *Family Empires*, chs. 14 and 15.

NOTES

7. Elliott, *Family Empires*, ch. 15.
8. Elliott, *Family Empires*, ch. 14.
9. Marika Rose, “Holy Mothers of God: Sex Work, Inheritance, and the Women of Jesus’ Genealogy,” *Theology & Sexuality* 25, nos. 1–2 (2019): 1–20, here 7, doi: 10.1080/13558358.2019.1652031.
10. Rose, “Holy Mothers,” 11–12.

Chapter 11: Join the Club

1. *Corpus inscriptionum latinarum* (CIL) XIV 2120. Consilio et Auctoritate Academiae Litterarum Regiae Borussicae Editum. Berlin: Georg Reimer, 1863–1974. Available from Last, Richard, trans., “Honors for C. Sulpicius Victor with Reference to a Women’s Assembly (curia) (ca. 200 CE), Lanuvium - Campania,” *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, Accessed July 23, 2021, HYPERLINK “[https://urldefense.com/v3/__http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/a-womens-assembly-curia-ca-200-ce/__;!!PH0vZokp8wwQNw!ijDvnYW5SiITU8KAw0Z0Y21gDN1GuJ9nGlSeqmo2L9svOj8l4-nmeFKz6RzfGstUgafqUA\\$](https://urldefense.com/v3/__http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/a-womens-assembly-curia-ca-200-ce/__;!!PH0vZokp8wwQNw!ijDvnYW5SiITU8KAw0Z0Y21gDN1GuJ9nGlSeqmo2L9svOj8l4-nmeFKz6RzfGstUgafqUA$)” <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/a-womens-assembly-curia-ca-200-ce/>.
2. IHistria 57, *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, “Honorary Decree for Aba with Mention of Associations (150–200 CE); Histria–Scythia and Moesia,” trans. Philip A. Harland, <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/honorary-decree-for-aba-150-200-ce/>.
3. ISmyrna 295 = IJO II 43, second–third century CE. From Richard S. Ascough, Philip A. Harland, and John S. Kloppenborg, “Family Grave of Rufina the Head of the Synagogue,” in *Associations in the Greco-Roman World: A Sourcebook* (Waco, TX: Baylor Univ. Press, 2012), 120.
4. CIL XIV 2112. Translation from *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, “Regulations of the Worshippers of Diana and Antinoüs (136 CE), Lanuvium–Campania,” trans. John S. Kloppenborg, <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/310-regulations-of-the-worshippers-of-diana-and-antinous/>.
5. TAM V 1539. Translation from *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, “Divine Instructions for the Household Association of Dionysios (late II–early I BCE), Philadelphia–Lydia,” trans. Philip A. Harland, <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/divine-instructions-for-the-household-association-of-dionysios/>.
6. Kirchner, Johannes, ed. *Inscriptiones Atticae Euclidis anno anteriores* (IG II²). 4 vols. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1913–1940. 1368.
7. All references to this inscription are from the translation of Richard S. Ascough, Philip A. Harland, and John S. Kloppenborg, “Regulations

NOTES

- of a Bacchic Association—The Iobacchoi,” in *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, 13–16.
8. Translation from Robert J. Miller, ed., *The Complete Gospels: The Scholars Version*, 4th ed. (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).
 9. Translated in Richard S. Ascough, Philip A. Harland, and John S. Kloppenborg, “Aelius Aristides of Smyrna (Ionia), Orations 45.27–28,” in *Associations in the Greco-Roman World*, 246.
 10. Andrew Monson, “The Ethics and Economics of Ptolemaic Religious Associations,” *Ancient Society* 36 (2006): 221–238, here 233–234, doi: 10.2143/AS.36.0.2017836.

Chapter 12: Feasting and Bathing

1. Translations of Gospel of Thomas are by Justin Lasser, “Gospel of Thomas,” in *A New New Testament: A Bible for the Twenty-First Century Combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts*, ed. Hal Taussig, 15–26 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013).
2. Translation from Robert J. Miller, ed., *The Complete Gospels: The Scholars Version*, 4th ed. (Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010).
3. Translation of Prayer of Thanksgiving by Celene Lillie, “The Prayer of Thanksgiving,” in *A New New Testament: A Bible for the Twenty-First Century combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts*, ed. Hal Taussig, 7 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013).
4. See also Andrew Brian McGowan, *Ancient Christian Worship: Early Church Practices in Social, Historical, and Theological Perspective* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2014).
5. Translation of Tertullian, *On Baptism*, by S. Thelwall, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 3, ed. Alexander Roberts, James Donaldson, and A. Cleveland Coxe (Buffalo, NY: Christian Literature Publishing, 1885); revised and edited for New Advent by Kevin Knight, <http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0321.htm>.
6. Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities*, Vol. VIII: Books 18–19, trans. Louis H. Feldman, Loeb Classical Library 433 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1965).

Chapter 13: Inventing Orthodoxy Through Heresy

1. See Josephus, *Jewish War* 2.119–166; *Jewish Antiquities* 13.171–173; 18.11–22.
2. Translation from Markus Vinzent, “Orthodoxy and Heresy: Misnomers and Misnamers,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Annual Meeting, Christianity Seminar, San Diego, November 2019.

NOTES

3. For a treatment of the importance of schools and school models in later antiquity, see Lillian I. Larsen and Samuel Rubenson, eds., *Monastic Education in Late Antiquity: The Transformation of Classical Paideia* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2018).
4. *First Letter of Clement*, in *The Apostolic Fathers*, Vol. 1, ed. and trans. Bart D. Ehrman, Loeb Classical Library 24 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 2003).
5. Ignatius, *To the Ephesians*, in *Apostolic Fathers*.
6. Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, trans. Philip Schaff, “ANF01. The Apostolic Fathers with Justin Martyr and Irenaeus,” Christian Classics Ethereal Library, https://ccel.org/ccel/irenaeus/against_heresies_iii/anf01.ix.iv.xix.html.
7. Translations of *Testimony of Truth* by Søren Giversen and Birger A. Pearson, “The Testimony of Truth,” Gnostic Society Library: The Nag Hammadi Library, <http://gnosis.org/naghamm/testruth.html>.
8. Translations of Acts of Paul and Thecla from J. K. Elliott, “The Acts of Paul and Thecla,” in *The Apocryphal New Testament*, ed. J. K. Elliott, 364 (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1993).

Chapter 14: Demolishing Gnosticism

1. Karen L. King, *What Is Gnosticism?* (Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 2003).
2. King, *What Is Gnosticism?*, 189.
3. Ursula K. Le Guin, “The Author of the Acacia Seeds,” in *The Unreal and the Real: The Selected Short Stories of Ursula K. Le Guin* (New York: Saga, 2012), 617–625.
4. Karen L. King, *The Secret Revelation of John* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 2009), ix.
5. King, *Secret Revelation*, 26.
6. King, *Secret Revelation*, 28.

Chapter 15: Paul Obscured

1. Translation of Ignatius, *To the Ephesians*, from Paul Trebilco, *The Early Christians in Ephesus from Paul to Ignatius* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007), 686.

Chapter 16: Jesus by Many Other Names

1. Except where otherwise noted, translations in this chapter of canonical writings—writings now found in the Hebrew Bible and the “New Testament”—are from the New Revised Standard Version, with adaptations by the authors shown in brackets.

NOTES

2. This translation is by the book editors, and is therefore not from the NRSV, as has been otherwise noted for other translations in this chapter.
3. Translation from Michael W. Holmes, *The Apostolic Fathers: Greek Texts and English Translations*, 3rd ed. (Ada, MI: Baker Academic, 2009).
4. Translations of the Gospel of Mary are from Karen L. King, *The Gospel of Mary of Magdala: Jesus and the First Woman Apostle* (Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge, 2003).
5. Translations of the Gospel of Truth, with some adaptations, by Celene Lillie, “The Gospel of Truth,” in *A New New Testament: A Bible for the Twenty-First Century Combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts*, ed. Hal Taussig, 230–241 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013).

Chapter 17: Hiding in Plain Sight

1. James C. Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 2008), 141, 143.
2. Translations of the Gospel of Truth by Celene Lillie, “The Gospel of Truth,” in *A New New Testament: A Bible for the Twenty-First Century Combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts*, ed. Hal Taussig, 230–241 (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013).
3. This is cleverly developed by Adela Yarbro Collins in *Crisis and Catharsis: The Power of the Apocalypse*, 152–154, 161, 166 (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1984).
4. Translations of *The Thunder: Perfect Mind* by Hal Taussig, Jared Calaway, Maia Kotrosits, Celene Lillie, and Justin Lasser, “The Thunder: Perfect Mind,” in *The Thunder: Perfect Mind: A New Translation and Introduction*. Hal Taussig et al. (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, a division of St. Martin’s Press. 183–188).
5. Lucius Apuleius, *Metamorphoses or the Golden Ass*, translation adapted by Paul Halsall from the translation of Adlington (1566) in comparison with that of Robert Graves (1951). Paul Halsall, “Lucius Apuleius (c. 155 CE): Isis, Queen of Heaven,” Fordham University, Ancient History Sourcebook, <https://sourcebooks.fordham.edu/ancient/lucius-assa.asp>.
6. New Revised Standard Version translation.

Chapter 18: Romancing the Martyr

1. Translations of the *Acts of Perpetua and Felicitas* are from Herbert Musurillo, trans., *Acts of the Christian Martyrs* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1972).

NOTES

2. Building on Judith Perkins, Carly Daniel-Hughes supports this reading in her paper for the Seminar, “Producing and Contesting Martyrdom in Pre-Decian Roman North Africa,” presented at the Westar Institute Spring Meeting, Christianity Seminar, Santa Rosa, CA, March 2015.
3. Translation of Pliny, *Letters*, LCL 59.
4. Lucian, The Passing of Peregrinus. Translations here and following from *Lucian*, Vol. V, trans. A. M. Harmon, Loeb Classical Library 302 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1936).
5. From Minucius Felix Tertullian, *Apology. De Spectaculis. Minucius Felix: Octavius*, trans. T. R. Glover and Gerald H. Rendall, Loeb Classical Library 250 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1931).
6. Judith Perkins, *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in Early Christianity* (London: Routledge, 1995), 23.
7. Translation adapted from Livy, *History of Rome*, LCL 114.
8. See Susan M. (Elli) Elliot, “Gladiators and Martyrs: Icons in the Arena,” *Forum* 3, no. 6 (2017): 29–59.
9. Perkins, *Suffering Self*, 15.
10. Chariton, *Callirhoe*, ed. and trans. G. P. Goold, Loeb Classical Library 481 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1995).
11. Perkins, *Suffering Self*, 26, uses Reardon’s translation in B. P. Reardon, ed., *Collected Ancient Greek Novels* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1989).
12. Perkins, *Suffering Self*, 27.
13. As adapted from Musurillo: “The Martyrdom of Perpetua and Felicitas,” from *The Acts of the Christian Martyrs*, trans. Herbert Musurillo (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1972).
14. Daniel-Hughes, “Producing and Contesting Martyrdom,” offers a helpful overview of responses that contested or countered so-called martyrdom.

Chapter 19: Better than a New Testament?

1. Quoted in Jessica Lussenhop, “Why Did Prince Change His Name to a Symbol?” BBC News Magazine, April 22, 2016, <https://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-36107590>.
2. Jason BeDuhn, “Becoming a People of the Book,” paper presented at the Westar Institute Spring Meeting, Christianity Seminar, online, May 2020.
3. Translation adapted from Matthew D. C. Larsen, *Gospels Before the Book* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2018), 93.
4. Larsen, *Gospels Before the Book*, 95–96.

NOTES

5. “The Gospels Are Finally Named! Irenaeus of Lyons,” is actually the title of a blog post by Bart D. Ehrman on his eponymous blog The Bart Erhman Blog: The History & Literature of Early Christianity, November 18, 2014, <https://ehrmanblog.org/the-gospels-are-finally-named-irenaeus-of-lyons/>.
6. Erin K. Vearncombe, “Gathered Around Absence: A First-Century Approach to the Text Known as ‘Mark,’” paper presented at the Westar Institute Spring Meeting, Christianity Seminar, online, May 2020. All citations of Vearncombe in this chapter refer to this paper.
7. Translation from Larsen, *Gospels Before the Book*, 150.
8. This translation of I Lydia HM 96 is from Associations in the Greco-Roman World, “Posthumous Honors by Heroists for Stratonike the Priestess (II BCE); Koloe area—Lydia,” trans. Philip A. Harland, <http://philipharland.com/greco-roman-associations/posthumous-honors-by-heroists-for-stratonike-ii-bce/>.
9. This image comes from Philip Pullman’s novel *The Golden Compass* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1995), ch. 9, “The Spies.” Lyra, the main character, describes how she interprets the symbols on a special piece of equipment in her possession called an “alethiometer”: “I kind of see ’em. Or feel ’em rather, like climbing down a ladder at night, you put your foot down and there’s another rung. Well, I put my mind down and there’s another meaning, and I kind of sense what it is. Then I put ’em all together. There’s a trick in it like focusing your eyes.”

Chapter 20: Conclusion

1. Snicket, Lemony. *The Austere Academy: Book the Fifth* (New York: HarperCollins, 2000), 187.

ANCIENT WRITINGS IN TRANSLATION: A GUIDE

This bibliography will enable readers to follow up on the discussions in this book by reading the primary sources, in translation, from or associated with the early groups of Jesus Anointed followers: gospels, acts accounts, histories, and letters by leaders of these groups, and the like. Individual writings (for example, the Gospel of Mary or the Acts of Perpetua and Felicitas) are noted in chapter endnotes. This guide is to collections of various ancient writings associated with or important for the study of the groups of Jesus Anointed.

A NOTE ON TRANSLATIONS

The Italian proverb “*Traduttore, traditore*” (to translate is to betray) sums up the problem with translations. All translations are mistranslations. Readers need to keep this in mind. Mistranslation is not deliberate but results from the inevitable fact that words and grammar do not have an exact correspondence between languages. So-called word-for-word or literal translations are actually impossible. Translation is always interpretation, whether or not it is admitted to be such. Also, a language over time shifts and changes, which is why we always need new translations.

Biblical translations have a way of taking on a “sacred” character, but they are still just translations. Reading multiple translations is always a good strategy.

ANCIENT WRITINGS IN TRANSLATION

COLLECTIONS OF ANCIENT WRITINGS

Perseus Digital Library, <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper>. This website covers the history, literature, and culture of the Greco-Roman world. It is an important resource when dealing with the ancient world.

A New English Translation of the Septuagint. Edited by Albert Pietersma and Benjamin G. Wright. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2007. The Septuagint is a Greek translation of the Hebrew Bible. It is the sacred writings of ancient Israelite and Judean communities, as well as those of Jesus Anointed. The Hebrew text on which it is based, as well as the books included, differs from the Masoretic Hebrew tradition that has led to much conflict between Catholic and Protestant editions of the Bible.

Early Jewish Writings, <http://www.earlyjewishwritings.com>. This website provides digital access to many early Jewish writings. Currently missing are the Dead Sea Scrolls (claimed to be forthcoming).

BibleGateway, <https://www.biblegateway.com>. This website provides easy access to multiple versions of the Bible in English, as well as several foreign languages. It allows users to read multiple versions of a given biblical passage side by side so that users can compare translations.

Bible, King James Version (1611). Authorized by King James VI, the translators of the New Testament were excellent Greek scholars who were still part of the living tradition of ancient rhetoric. While antiquated in many ways, this translation is often worth looking at because of the translators' understanding of rhetoric and as an important point in the history of translation into English. Many English versions of the Bible are revisions of the King James Version. Available on many internet sites.

The HarperCollins Study Bible: Fully Revised & Updated. Edited by Harold W. Attridge and Wayne A. Meeks. San Francisco: HarperOne, 2006. General reference Bible using the New Revised Standard Version. Includes articles, introductions, and notes by scholars for the Society of Biblical Literature.

The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha. Vol. 1: Apocalyptic Literature and Testaments. Vol. 2: Expansions of the "Old Testament" and Legends, Wisdom and Philosophical Literature, Prayers, Psalms, and Odes, Fragments of Lost Judeo-Hellenistic Works. Edited by James H. Charlesworth. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1983 and 1985. Although not produced by groups of Jesus Anointed followers, these writings often influenced them. The translations are excellent, with strong introductions and notes.

Early Christian Writings, <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/intro.html>. This website collects in digital format all known so-called

ANCIENT WRITINGS IN TRANSLATION

Christian writings from the first two centuries, as well as a selection from the third century. An Index (<http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/index.html>) lists all these writings in chronological order.

Provides easy digital access to a great many writings.

Ante-Nicene Fathers. Edited by Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson. 10 vols. Edinburg: T&T Clark, 1867 and 1873. US edition, 1885, edited by Cleveland Coxe. As its subtitle of the 1885 edition indicates, this contains “The Writings of the Fathers Down to A.D. 325.” The translation is antiquated but more important is missing all the writings that have been discovered since the late nineteenth century. It is still available in reprint editions, free on Kindle, and on the internet (https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Ante-Nicene_Fathers). Even given its limitations, it is still worth consulting.

New Testament Apocrypha. Vol. 1: Gospels and Related Writings. Vol. 2: Writings Relating to the Apostles; Apocalypses and Related Subjects. Edited by Edgar Hennecke and Wilhelm Schneemelcher. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1963 and 1965. A translation of the standard German collection of New Testament apocrypha. Good introductions.

The Apocryphal New Testament. Edited by J. K. Elliott. Oxford: Clarendon, 2005. A translation similar to that of Edgar Hennecke and Wilhelm Schneemelcher and based on the earlier work of M. R. (Montague Rhodes) James (1924).

The Authentic Letters of Paul: A New Reading of Paul’s Rhetoric and Meaning. Edited by Arthur J. Dewey, Roy W. Hoover, Lane C. McGaughy, and Daryl D. Schmidt. Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010. A completely new translation of Paul’s letters that pays attention to their rhetoric. It breaks away from the King James tradition. With introductions and notes.

The Gnostic Society Library, <http://gnosis.org/library.html>. A major digital archive of all Nag Hammadi documents discovered in the past century. Although committed to a twenty-first-century “gnostic” interpretation, this website provides good scholarship and translations.

The Nag Hammadi Library in English. Edited by Marvin Meyer and James M. Robinson. San Francisco: HarperCollins, 2009. New translations and introductions to all the writings discovered in 1945 at Nag Hammadi, Egypt, a major find.

A New New Testament: A Bible for the 21st Century Combining Traditional and Newly Discovered Texts. Edited by Hal Taussig. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2013. New translations of ten new writings alongside traditional New Testament writings.

The Complete Gospels. Edited by Robert J. Miller. Salem, OR: Polebridge, 2010. A translation with introductions and notes to all the early extant gospels. The translation breaks with the King James Version tradition.

ANCIENT WRITINGS IN TRANSLATION

The Apostolic Fathers. Vol. 1: I Clement, II Clement, Ignatius, Polycarp, Didache; Volume II. Epistle of Barnabas. Papias and Quadratus. Epistle to Diognetus. The Shepherd of Hermas. Translated Bart D. Ehrman. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 2003. Part of the Loeb Classical Library, a standard collection of Greek and Latin writings with English translations on facing pages. This collection of early Christian writings dates from the seventeenth century.

The Acts of the Christian Martyrs. Herbert Musurillo. Oxford: Clarendon, 1972. Greek and Latin texts with translations and short commentaries. The standard for dealing with these writings.